**Mid-term Evaluation of the Patsy Collins Trust Fund Initiative Cohort One Innovations**

**CARE Cambodia Bending Bamboo Program: An Addendum**

Prepared by:

Archer Consulting

Alexandria, VA

January 2012

**Contents**

[I. Introduction 1](#_Toc313303241)

[A. Background 1](#_Toc313303242)

[B. Purpose of This Report 2](#_Toc313303243)

[C. Methodology 2](#_Toc313303244)

[D. The Need for PCTFI in Cambodia 2](#_Toc313303245)

[II. The Response: Bending Bamboo 5](#_Toc313303246)

[A. Bending Bamboo: A Description 5](#_Toc313303247)

[B. Findings 7](#_Toc313303248)

[1. Early Childhood Education 7](#_Toc313303249)

[2. Bilingual Education 8](#_Toc313303250)

[3. Life Skills 9](#_Toc313303251)

[4. Teacher Training 11](#_Toc313303252)

[5. Research and Advocacy 11](#_Toc313303253)

[6. Fact Checking 12](#_Toc313303254)

[C. Extent to Which Bending Bamboo Responds to the Situational Analysis 13](#_Toc313303255)

[D. Conclusions 16](#_Toc313303256)

[III. Impact to Date: Making a Positive and Enduring Influence on the Lives of Marginalized Girls 18](#_Toc313303257)

[A. Bending Bamboo: Addressing the PCTFI Common Indicators Framework 18](#_Toc313303258)

[1. Findings 18](#_Toc313303259)

[2. Fact Checking 20](#_Toc313303260)

[3. Conclusions 21](#_Toc313303261)

[B. Global Impact to Date: Addressing PCTFI’s Global Objectives 22](#_Toc313303262)

[1. Findings 22](#_Toc313303263)

[2. Conclusions 22](#_Toc313303264)

[C. Preparing Girls to Learn and Lead: Advancing CARE’s Power Within Initiative 23](#_Toc313303265)

[1. Findings 24](#_Toc313303266)

[2. Conclusions 25](#_Toc313303267)

[D. Project Orientation to Program Approach 26](#_Toc313303268)

[IV. Looking to the Future: Recommendations 27](#_Toc313303269)

[A. Suggested Changes to Project Direction and Execution 27](#_Toc313303270)

[B. Opportunities for Sustainability, Scale Up, and Greater Impact 28](#_Toc313303271)

[C. Tools, Methods, Partners, or Other Resources 32](#_Toc313303272)

[Bibliography 35](#_Toc313303273)

[Appendices 37](#_Toc313303274)

[Appendix A: Questionnaire on CO Involvement in the Five Objectives of the PCTFI Between March 2009 and the Present 37](#_Toc313303275)

[Appendix B: Questionnaire on Country Participation in the Ten Power Within Pathways 39](#_Toc313303276)

[Appendix C: Telephone Interview Guidelines 41](#_Toc313303277)

[Appendix D: Overview of Teacher Training Workshops for Bilingual Community Teachers 42](#_Toc313303278)

# I. Introduction

## Background

The Patsy Collins Trust Fund Initiative (PCTFI) is a 20-year, $28 million education program funded in 2003 by the Priscilla (Patsy) Bullitt Collins Charitable Remainder Unitrust (the Patsy Collins Trust Fund) to make a difference for marginalized girls by ensuring their rights to appropriate education and development, supporting their positive participation in their communities and society, and empowering them to fulfill their greatest human potential. PCTFI is one of two global initiatives in CARE’s Basic and Girls’ Education (BGE) Unit that focuses on girls’ education. With a mission to improve girls’ attainment, equality, quality, and empowerment, PCTFI is encompassed within Power Within, CARE’s global program to support girls in completing their primary education and developing their leadership skills.

PCTFI supports two, 10-year longitudinal innovation cohorts, where groups of country offices learn together about the impact of innovative approaches to education. Unlike more traditional short-term projects, PCTFI programs are intended to be more long-term educational innovations that impact girls’ education at the systems level. Each 10-year effort has three phases: a first phase, which focuses on situational analysis; a second phase, which focuses on strengthened program design; and a third phase, which focuses on deeper impact research and advocacy. The four countries that were chosen for Cohort One – Cambodia, Honduras, Mali, and Tanzania -- were tasked with taking the best of innovative ideas coming from country offices and creating a joint learning agenda around them. The second cohort of countries – Bangladesh, Ghana, India, and Malawi – was selected to produce experimental designs to test innovations in formal primary schools in each of the participating country offices. In yet another major PCTFI initiative, the Advocacy Grants Program, countries are awarded two-year grants to build evidence for better advocacy and to bring more attention to the underlying causes of poverty and poor education for girls (CARE n.d.(h)).

In February 2011, Management Systems International (MSI) was contracted by CARE USA to conduct a mid-term evaluation of the Cohort I country programs funded by PCTFI. After MSI conducted three site visits and submitted country reports for Cambodia, Honduras, and Tanzania, CARE ended the contract with MSI and contracted with Archer Consulting to complete the work.

## Purpose of This Report

This report complements MSI’s mid-term country report of the Bending Bamboo Program in Cambodia. It includes a detailed description of the Bending Bamboo program activities, clarifications of program findings, discussions of the extent to which the program activities address the needs outlined in the situational analysis, and summaries of Bending Bamboo’s contributions to the PCTFI common indicators framework, the PCTFI global objectives, and Power Within.

## Methodology

To compile this addendum, the consultant team met with members of the BGE Unit, who summarized the new contract needs and provided the MSI partial report and other background materials. Archer Consulting reviewed and analyzed the information, developed matrices of the reported and missing information, submitted matrices to CARE Cambodia field staff for completion, and conducted two fact-checking telephone interviews (see Appendices A, B, and C for research tools). Responses and results were checked against the original report findings and documented.

Archer Consulting experienced some difficulty in compiling information about the PCTFI-funded interventions being conducted in Cambodia. Some of the interventions have complex histories, with a variety of previous and current sponsors and funding sources. For example, Bending Bamboo builds on the Highland Children’s Education Project (HCEP), under which the bilingual education for remote highland villages was developed. Components have been funded by CARE Australia and UNICEF. Findings are often combined in reports with figures from HCEP and the more comprehensive Highland Communities Program under which Bending Bamboo is housed. Cambodia staff and bi-annual reports helped to strip through some of the complexities of this program’s approach. To facilitate clarification, in the matrices of program activities in Appendices A and B, funders other than PCTFI are highlighted in color.

## The Need for PCTFI in Cambodia

In Cambodia, a largely agricultural country in Southeast Asia, the majority of the national population is Khmer, and Khmer is the national language. In northeastern Cambodia, however, which includes some of the country’s most remote and isolated areas, local indigenous languages are spoken, and school attendance beyond grade two is limited, especially for girls. Research documented that girls from indigenous ethnic minority communities in these northeastern highlands are marginalized from almost all educational opportunities.

CARE had already successfully developed a basic model of bilingual and bicultural community school education in remote highland villages through its Highland Children’s Education Project (HCEP). Building on HCEP’s success, the proposed PCTFI initiative, “Bending Bamboo,” was to “take the first step towards mainstreaming the HCEP model of education into government schools in ethnic minority areas.” (MSI 2011, p.10). By improving ethnic minority girls’ access to relevant education and the community’s support of that education, Bending Bamboo would address attainment, equality, quality, and empowerment issues. A concept paper was submitted in April 2005, and CARE USA selected the project for the first cohort of countries to receive funding. After contract start-up, a detailedsituational analysis was conducted from December 2005 – December 2007. This exercise identified the following critical problems leading to girls’ marginalization:

* high domestic workload burdens;
* insufficient government support for indigenous communities, as manifested by poorly trained teachers, a lack of indigenous teachers and motivation, and under-resourced schools and school system;
* a curriculum with an over-emphasis on Khmer and a lack of relevant learning materials and a common language shared by teachers and students;
* poor access, including long distances and poor infrastructure in schools beyond second grade, along with teacher bias toward “best students” and Khmer boys; and
* relocation of indigenous populations due to deforestation, language alienation, the lack of experience in cash crops, the Khmer markets, and the costs of ill health” (CARE n.d.(h)).

Using the situational analysis results, CARE revised the Bending Bamboo program design, so as to free indigenous girls from the traditional duties that prevented them from going to school while making the school environment more welcoming and accepting of the non-Khmer-speaking population. More specifically, Bending Bamboo was designed to address barriers identified in the situational analysis by providing the following:

* early childhood education, to give care and instruction to younger siblings, thereby reducing girls’ high domestic workload burdens;
* life skills education for girls who missed school during their primary school-age years;
* bilingual primary school education for indigenous girls in the early primary school years;
* teacher training to improve the quality of instruction in state schools; and
* advocacy for girls’ rights.

A chronology of development is provided in Figure 1. Program activities are described in Chapter II.**Figure 1: Bending Bamboo: CARE Chronology of Events**

2003 PCTFI awarded to CARE USA

2004 PCTFI global strategy approved within CARE USA

2005 Concept paper submitted

Bending Bamboo started

Situational analysis started

2007 Situational analysis ended

Bilingual mapping exercise conducted

2009 ECD/Life Skills Center design completed

ECD play groups established

In-service ECD training provided for group facilitators

Bending Bamboo bilingual education model accepted for area’s formal schools

TA to replicate bilingual education model provided

In-service training provided for upper grade teachers

2010 ECD Life Skill Centers completed

ECD curriculum initiated

Bilingual education provided in grades one and two of formal schools

Source: (CARE n.d.(c), n.d.(d), and n.d.(e)).

# II. The Response: Bending Bamboo

## Bending Bamboo: A Description

As its target site, CARE Cambodia selected seven small, remote villages (with 100-300 people, 15-99 households in a village) in Ratanakiri Province, 600 km north of Phnom Penh, to receive services under the PCTFI initiative. The targeted group is further defined as follows:

* 371 households in seven villages;
* six schools within the seven villages;
* girls 6-12 years old who had not enrolled in or had dropped out of school and adolescent mothers ages 13-18;
* children ages 0-6 in the care of school-aged girls; and
* students attending state primary schools in the target area.

The overall goal of Bending Bamboo -- children from indigenous ethnic minority communities able to access relevant education -- has five subcategories as listed in Figure 2. These subgoals correspond to some extent with the situational analysis.

**Figure 2. Bending Bamboo: Goals/Sub goals, Interventions/Activities, and Situational Analysis Focus Areas[[1]](#footnote-1)**

**Goal: Children from indigenous ethnic minority communities able to access relevant education**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Bending Bamboo Subgoals** | **Bending Bamboo**  **Interventions/Activities** | **Situational Analysis Focus Areas** |
| Increased capacity to provide quality education in Bending Bamboo villages | Bilingual education model in state schools in the BB area | Bilingual Education |
| Increased provision of quality education for indigenous out-of-school girls in seven target villages | Bilingual instruction in grades 1-2  Instruction of life skills in formal school/grades 1-3  Nationally endorsed child friendly schools model  In-service training sessions on child-friendly practices  In-service workshops for state school teachers to teach upper primary curriculum | Bilingual Education  Life Skills Education  Teacher Training |
| Advocacy and awareness raising around land rights and forest access | Land rights advocacy activities (Postponed due to community issues[[2]](#footnote-2))  Coalitions developed to address land titling | Advocacy |
| Coalition building for cross-sectoral provision of community services |  | Advocacy |
| Advocacy for improved provision of basic education for indigenous ethnic minority girls | Village women’s committees  Comparative research on academic achievements of students participating/not participating in Bending Bamboo  Contact with Ministry about scaling up the Bending Bamboo model.  Community-inspired ECE curriculum  Pre-service in-service training for indigenous ECD facilitators  Construction of ECD centers and school wells and latrines  ECE instruction three mornings a week | Early Childhood Development  Research  Advocacy |

Below are detailed descriptions of the Bending Bamboo interventions/activities.

## Findings

### Early Childhood Education

Bending Bamboo’s early childhood development program was designed to address the high domestic workload burdens that girls in northeastern Cambodia experienced. The proposed assistance included facility construction, training for the facilitators, and a curriculum. Progress has been made on each of these activities.

Through PCTFI, in collaboration and consultation with the Cambodian government, CARE Cambodia constructed six two-room centers, with one room for ECD and the second room for literacy, numeracy, and life skills training (see below for discussion of life skills). Complete with solar panels funded by the Charitable Foundation of Joel Bassat, these energy-efficient centers were completed in 2010. As a result, all Bending Bamboo villages now have an operational center. Some play materials and equipment were purchased. Other materials were made by the Village Women’s Committee (VWC).

Children participate in the ECD program through nonformal “play groups,” which meet three mornings a week. While the bi-annual report notes that the play groups are well attended, the report included no enrollment or attendance data for these play groups. PCTFI staff recruited and hired ethnic minority community members to staff the centers. (All of the ECD teachers/facilitators in Bending Bamboo are female.) Pre-service training was provided for the teachers, and in-service teacher training is ongoing. As of the spring of 2011, the centers currently are in use, and children are being taught. Two people in each village -- one from the VWC and one early childhood teacher – have been appointed to look after the solar panels and supporting equipment.

The curriculum for the ECD program is still in progress. Initially the ECD program was deliberately used the term, play groups to underscore the intended nonformal nature of the program. The current curriculum for the ECD play groups was developed during two action research workshops involving the VWCs and the ECD and life skills facilitators. CARE is continuing to work with women from the local community to complete the ECD curriculum, which may be completed by the end of this year (CARE Cambodia Staff 2011c). Because of the success of the bilingual language program at the primary level, CARE was invited to advise the Cambodian government on how the ECD instruction could be provided in the local language.

In 2010, the Royal Government of Cambodia approved a national policy of early childhood development, and the Early Childhood and Education Department (ECED) within the Ministry is developing a National Action Plan to implement the policy. The Ministry has contracted CARE to provide technical support and input on the process, particularly as it relates to working ethnic minority communities.

### Bilingual Education

The HCEP bilingual education model, later adopted as the Bending Bamboo model, has several unique features. First, Bending Bamboo gradually introduces indigenous children to Khmer, the national language, during grades one to three. Students advance from 80 percent of instruction provided in the local language during grade 1 to 70 percent of the classroom instruction provided in the national language in grade 3. During grades 4-6, all classroom instruction is provided in Khmer (see Figure 3). No English is included in the Bending Bamboo language model.

**Figure 3. The HCEP/Bending Bamboo Bilingual Model –Percentages of Languages of Instruction, by Grade**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Grade** | **Local**  **Language** | **Khmer**  **(National Language)** |
| 1 | 80%  - 15% Math  - 35% Social studies  - 30% Language studies | 20% (oral only) |
| 2 | 60%  - 25% Language studies  - 35% Social studies | 40%  - 25% Language studies  - 15% Math |
| 3 | 30%  - 15% Language studies  - 15% Social studies | 70%  - 15% Math  - 45% Language studies  - 10% Social studies |
| 4-6 | -- | 100% |

Source: CARE Cambodia Staff 2011(a).

Second, the Bending Bamboo bilingual education program is taught by people from the community. Bending Bamboo recruited and trained 18 local adults – including four women-- (about 22 percent) to teach. Teachers instruct the classes, which include girls and boys. During the week, these same teachers attend nonformal education classes so that they can graduate from 9th grade. From there, they can qualify to attend a government-run teacher training college in order to become certified Government teachers.

Third, the Bending Bamboo bilingual education curriculum uses its own materials. Although the Bending Bamboo bilingual program is based on the formal school curriculum goals and objectives, Bending Bamboo students use books and materials developed by indigenous populations, with local stories developed for their own regions. A resource production unit developed sets of materials until 2010. CARE Australia funded the Resource Production Unit for FY 2011.

Finally, unlike other bilingual education models, which are generally implemented in nonformal settings, the Bending Bamboo model has been accepted by the Ministry of Education and is being implemented in what are now state schools. Originally, bilingual education was being provided to isolated areas through the HCEP schools, which are community schools. The instructional program in the community schools was so well received, however, that the government/ministry agreed to include the bilingual program into selected state schools in the target area. CARE Cambodia’s team considers Bending Bamboo as “another significant step towards the MoEYS officially recognizing and mainstreaming bilingual education for ethnic minority children.”

### Life Skills

The thinking behind the independent life skills instruction for older indigenous girls was that having younger siblings in quality early education programs would free overage girls to enroll in educational programs. Planners assumed that these girls would attend nonformal education centers, where they could learn basic literacy and numeracy and life skills that they had previously missed. Bending Bamboo’s two-room buildings were constructed to house the ECD and life skills programs. A list of topics and related books were developed for grades 1-3 in Bending Bamboo schools (see Figure 4).

**Figure 4. Life Skills Topics for HCEP/Bending Bamboo Bilingual Curriculum[[3]](#footnote-3)**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Grade** | **Life Skills Book Titles/Topics** |
| 1 | Looking after Chickens  Personal Hygiene  The Market |
| 2 | How to Weave a Chicken’s Nest  Medicine from the Forest  Traps  The Cashew Farm  How to Make a Cha Pei Klook  Honey from the Forest  Pa and Cha Go to the Market  At the Petrol Station |
| 3 | Resin from the Forest  Mosquito Book  The Importance of the Gourd  Bartering at Ban Lung Market  Sophea’s Family Food Stall  When Laik and Mek Grow Up  The Case of the Missing Cow |

By the time the centers were constructed, however, bilingual education was being provided in the state schools that were participating in Bending Bamboo, and most of the out-of-school girls enrolled in the state schools. There was no longer a need for a separate literacy and life skills facility. The second rooms in the newly constructed centers were reallocated for bilingual classes (see description of bilingual education above).

Bending Bamboo teachers use the guide in integrating these life skills into the bilingual education for grades 1-3. For grades four through six, teachers integrate Bending Bamboo life skills into the standard curriculum. Teacher training sessions help teachers to use existing materials in creative ways.

It is noted here that although these skills may be relevant to indigenous girls’ daily lives, they are incongruent with more internationally accepted “life skills” used by UNICEF, UNESCO, and the World Health Organization: problem solving; critical thinking; effective communication skills; decision making; creative thinking; interpersonal relationship skills; self awareness skills; empathy; and coping with stress and emotions ([www.unodc.org/pdf/youthnet/action/message/escap\_peers\_07.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/pdf/youthnet/action/message/escap_peers_07.pdf)).

### Teacher Training

There are four components to this activity:

* developing and implementing school improvement plans by the establishment and ongoing training of school support committees;
* building the capacity of school support committees through workshops and ongoing support;
* establishing an in-service training program for state school teachers; and
* providing ongoing pre-service and in-service training for community bilingual teachers.

A school improvement workshop was held in February 2011, where school support committees, consisting of community members and teachers, came together and developed school community plans. This process built grassroots support and ownership of the program. Funds were provided to the schools. Other workshops included training on transparent and accountable strategies for administering the grant.

Training for bilingual teachers in Bending Bamboo and HCEP is continuous and ongoing. In the first half of 2011 alone, CARE staff reported three 2-day, in-service training workshops for state school teachers and eight teacher training workshops for bilingual community teachers. A total of 138 enrolled in the teacher training workshops and 113 attended. Detailed lists of training sessions in 2011 are provided in Appendix D. It should be noted that figures include Bending Bamboo and HCEP teachers.

### Research and Advocacy

CARE collects data for the PCTFI common instruments, which are analyzed by the Minnesota International Development Education Consortium (MIDEC). In addition, MIDEC completed an analysis of the workload of girls. There is also a study to assess the academic performance of ethnic minority children who have a bilingual education compared to ethnic minority children whose education is in the national language, Khmer, only. These tests are in mathematics, oral Khmer, and Khmer literacy. Bending Bamboo is preparing to compare data concerning the difference in school calendars between state schools and HCEP/Bending Bamboo schools.

In promoting the bilingual education and life skills programs, Bending Bamboo advocates for girls’ education and quality education for ethnic minorities. In response to husbands’ feedback on their wives spending time at the ECD center and away from home, PTCFI held a workshop with husbands to discuss the issues.

PCTFI also identified land ownership of marginalized ethnic minorities as an important issue and wants to work on supporting indigenous communities securing land tenure. Because CARE's programs aim to address the underlying causes of poverty, for indigenous people, the loss of land due to the rapid economic development in this part of Cambodia directly affects their livelihoods and their level of poverty. As reported by CARE staff, however, supporting indigenous communities securing land tenure is a very challenging direction, and CARE has had to work in partnership with other NGOs to address it. Several NGO workers were threatened, and powerful people put pressure on the provincial authorities to cooperate in making land available for economic land concessions. Land loss also led to tensions within communities. With several NGO projects working on the land issue, the community members no longer wanted to be involved as they feared conflicts within the community. (The same signals came from community members in the food security project.)

Bending Bamboo postponed activities when problems arose but now has developed an alternative intervention for supporting communities in dealing with land tenure. Under the Policy for Development of Ethnic Minority People, it is now possible for indigenous communities to register as a legal entity. This enables them to claim a communal land title, which is one way of mitigating the huge loss of land. CARE Cambodia has developed a proposal to support indigenous communities working with CARE to register as legal entities.

### Fact Checking

There are mixed findings concerning whether the community feels that the inclusion of life skills improves the quality of education that is provided. MSI reported that the situational analysis showed no direct investigation of interest in the NFE/life skills approach and site a lack of participation of the impact group in the life skills component as evidence that the community had little interest in life skills. MSI labels it “problematic” and questions what led CARE Cambodia to think that a nonformal life skills education program would be desired. While the project has tried to turn this situation around and ‘mainstream’ life skills topics into the formal education classes, MSI suggests that this “may not be the best way to proceed,” and included as one of its recommendations that the life skills program be replaced with a mentoring program.

Although this evaluator does not challenge the chain of events, we do acknowledge that an absence of girls in the nonformal life skills center does not necessarily mean that there was no interest in life skills. In developing the life skills instruction, the assumption was that if Bending Bamboo created space for the younger brothers and sisters, the older girls would go to the nonformal centers. Instead the girls chose to enroll in the state schools where instruction also was being provided using the local language. When it was evident that a separate nonformal life skills program was not responsive, the program plan was modified and the instruction was transferred to the Bending Bamboo schools. This modified approach may lead to more sustainability. CARE Cambodia staff acknowledged that they should have learned more about community interest in life skills during the situational analysis, but feel that they were “responsive to the development in the community that rendered the life skills activity redundant.” To date, AC has found no data to document how Bending Bamboo enrollees have responded to the life skills instruction, whether they feel that the content is useful, and whether it is contributing to girls’ attainment, equality, quality, or empowerment.

## Extent to Which Bending Bamboo Responds to the Situational Analysis

Bending Bamboo seems to be addressing most, but not all, of the identified barriers outlined in the situational analysis. For the ECD component, schools were constructed, training was provided, children are enrolled, and a curriculum is being compiled.

Although there is not yet any direct evidence concerning whether Bending Bamboo is reducing girls’ workloads, CARE has taken several steps to address this issue. A research tool has been developed, and baseline data have been collected. CARE has produced a book, “Girls Lead the Way,” in four indigenous languages, on the workload of girls and household bargaining, commissioned a ‘traditional’ Tampuen song and dance on the issue of the workload of girls, which was performed at the community level as a community awareness-raising activity, and convened an Assembly on the Workload of Girls with 115 participants from 11 communities, where participants planned ‘community-based, awareness-raising activities’. CARE will compile a report on the results of the monitoring of community activities and collect data again on girls’ workload in January 2012. A second assembly on this issue to present the research results and formulate new action plans is being planned (CARE Staff 2011(b)).

Bending Bamboo seems to have generated more government support for education in the targeted area, with revitalized, state-supported schools. Supported by Bending Bamboo, there are more indigenous teachers, teachers in these schools are better trained, and the instruction reflects a better appreciation for the local language and culture. As previously stated, activities related to land tenure and reforestation were postponed, but new steps have been taken.

**Figure 5. Bending Bamboo’s Responsiveness to the Situational Analysis**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Desired Outcome (from Situational Analysis)** | **Is Bending Bamboo Responsive?** | **Evidence** |
| Lowered domestic work load burdens | In process | Activities have been/are being implemented to raise community awareness and measure change in girls’ workload burdens |
| Increased government support for indigenous trained teachers | Yes | Government-accepted Bending Bamboo Schools  Government payment of teachers |
| More indigenous teachers | Yes | Indigenous teachers teaching in Bending Bamboo schools, grades 1-3  Indigenous teachers teaching in ECDs |
| Better resourced schools | Yes | Learning materials provided |
| Local language instruction | Yes | Bilingual instruction in grades 1-3 |
| Relevant learning materials | Yes | Materials translated into five local languages |
| Common language shared by teachers and students | Yes | Indigenous teachers speaking local languages to students in grades 1-3 |
| Schools in closer proximity to home | Yes | Revitalized government schools in local communities |
| Better school infrastructure | Yes | Revitalized government schools in local communities |
| Reduced relocation due to deforestation, land tenure, etc. | Not yet | Earlier activities postponed due to community sensitivities. CARE Cambodia has now developed a proposal to support indigenous communities working with CARE to register as legal entities. |

In responding to the situational analysis, Bending Bamboo is also meeting the goals and subgoals of the program. Bending Bamboo’s bilingual education component and its nonformal school counterpart, the HCEP schools, have increased Cambodia’s capacity to provide quality education in Bending Bamboo villages. The number of bilingual schools rose from 6 in 2003 to 30 in 2011 (Bi-annual Report, Jan-June 2011). The number of ethnic minority children receiving bilingual education increased from 278 in 2003 to 2,307 in 2011, with even higher expectations in 2012. Of the 2,307 ethnic minority children enrolled in 2011, 1,054 were girls. With the increased capacity, Cambodia is providing instruction to more indigenous girls. In formal schools and nonformal education centers, indigenous girls are attending school, learning basic language and math skills while studying the national language and their local language (Bi-Annual Report Jan-June 2011).

Unfortunately, available figures did not show how much of this increase was due solely to Bending Bamboo. Because Bending Bamboo formal schools were not started until 2009, however, AC assumes that some of this increase is due to programs in place before Bending Bamboo was adopted. It is too early to say whether Bending Bamboo is improving the provision of basic education to indigenous girls or whether it is having a greater impact than the standard HCEP bilingual education model.

Nevertheless, Bending Bamboo is increasing the capacity to provide quality education for indigenous girls in another way. By introducing a new phased-in bilingual instructional model in grades 1 to 3 and providing classes for grades 4 to 6, which were not being taught at the time, Bending Bamboo is revitalizing many so-called incomplete government schools in the northeastern rural areas, thus improving instruction and increasing access to formal school. As shared by CARE Cambodia staff (CARE Cambodia Staff 2011c), the Ministry of Education in Cambodia is pleased with the success of the program and is planning to expand it into other schools. “For the first time in some remote villages, children can understand what is going on in school.” It is important to note that the Bending Bamboo bilingual education model provides instruction to boys and girls.

## Conclusions

Bending Bamboo is a well thought out program with several components.

Bilingual education is the centerpiece of this effort. Although bilingual education is not a new concept to developing education, it is new to isolated, northeast Cambodia. It also is unique in that it is one of the first bilingual education programs to be adopted by the formal school system.

In the debate concerning whether to use bilingual education or a national standard language to teach indigenous populations, CARE Cambodia’s Bending Bamboo model has been cited as one of the more promising bilingual education models in the region (CARE Cambodia Staff 2011(c)). With its phased-in approach to the instruction of Khmer, its transition to the national language after grade 3, and its relevant, locally-developed materials, Bending Bamboo appears to be a logical and well-thought out approach to introducing a standard language. Children and families are interested in the program, and both school-aged and over-aged girls have enrolled. In addition, as reported in the biannual report, because of the work of HCEP over nine years, “the idea of bilingual education has gained increasing acceptance, if not enthusiasm from Ministry officials, particularly at the provincial level but also at the national level” (CARE n.d.(a)). Bending Bamboo staff has been invited to speak to other planners. UNICEF and UNESCO reference it (CARE Cambodia Staff 2011(c)). The Cambodian government wants to expand it into five provinces, which would help with sustainability.

The life skills component was originally stalled but is now being taught as part of the formal school curriculum. While the topics are very specific to the particular community, the life skills component can play an important role in an education program for older girls. The topics included are relevant to the girls enrolled. Expanding the topics to include more general life and leadership skills like planning, organizing, problem solving, and communication could further enhance relevance and usefulness. Adding a mentoring component could further encourage participation, achievement, and goal setting. Integrating the life skills into the formal school curriculum helps to ensure that life skills instruction will continue. Through Bending Bamboo, life skills education is being provided for girls who missed school during their primary school-age years.Both as independent nonformal education centers and now in the state school settings, the life skills content and materials presented in Bending Bamboo reflect activities that girls can use in their communities. Nevertheless, it is unclear whether these life skills are improving the quality of education for indigenous girls.

Preschools are often used in the developing world context as they are in the Bending Bamboo innovation to prepare children for school and at the same time provide care so that parents and/or other caretakers can work or pursue other activities. In the targeted regions, the newly constructed, technologically innovative, dual-purpose community facilities, which were intended first to include ECD and life skills instruction and later ECD and bilingual education, have generated pride and interest, model cost efficiency and energy conservation, and provide meeting space to the surrounding community. Assigning monitoring of the solar equipment to people who are involved with the program and then training them on how to use and maintain the equipment help to build sustainability. Although there is no data to confirm or refute whether the ECD program is a tipping point for reducing girls’ workloads so that they can enroll in school, the program is favorably regarded by the government, and there is the strong link with the Ministry of Youth Education and Sports. MoEYS has already expressed interest in a bilingual model for ECD, and CARE is developing a curriculum to teach preschool in the local language and possibly testing this model in Bending Bamboo areas. MSI sees the increasing engagement with government as positive and recommends TA in policy development to support this.

# III. Impact to Date: Making a Positive and Enduring Influence on the Lives of Marginalized Girls

This section includes discussions of Bending Bamboo’s contributions to three of CARE’s guiding frameworks for its BGE Unit: the PCTFI common indicators framework (CIF); the PCTFI’s global objectives; and the 10 pathways of the Power Within Initiative.

## Bending Bamboo: Addressing the PCTFI Common Indicators Framework

CARE USA’s CIF is intended to measure outcomes of PCTFI in four areas: attainment, equality, quality, and empowerment.

### Findings

Based on a review of documents, telephone interviews, and other data collection, it appears that Bending Bamboo addresses various elements of the CIF framework. First, bilingual education in general, and Bending Bamboo in particular, has an impact on participation. The number of bilingual schools increased from 6 in 2003 to 30 in 2011, and the number of ethnic minority children receiving bilingual education increased from 278 in 2003 to 2,307 in 2011. As shown in Figure 6, in 2011, 337 ethnic minority children received bilingual education via Bending Bamboo schools, and 637 ethnic minority children from Bending Bamboo schools were attending primary schools. Almost 3,000 ethnic minority children are receiving bilingual education through HCEP, Bending Bamboo, and Ministry replication schools (CARE Cambodia Staff 2011(d). Note that Bending Bamboo did not start until 2005, with the centers accepted as formal schools in 2009.

**Figure 6. Overview of Bilingual Education in Northeast Cambodia**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Category** | **2011 Figures** |
| Number of bilingual schools | 30 |
| Number of ethnic minority children receiving bilingual education via Bending Bamboo schools | 337 |
| Number of ethnic minority children from *Bending Bamboo* schools attending primary schools | 637 (includes 337 in bilingual education classes) |
| Total number of ethnic minority children attending bilingual schools in HCEP, Bending Bamboo, and in Ministry replication schools | 2,889 |

The number of ethnic minority children from Bending Bamboo schools attending primary schools suggests but does not document definitively school retention or persistence. CARE Tanzania reports in its January – June 2011 Biannual Report (CARE n.d.(b)), that they are seeking advice concerning appropriate strategies for tracking completion, persistence, and retention, which are currently not being tracked (p. 32).

Bending Bamboo is impacting equality, that is, it is creating equal conditions for women and men for realizing their full human rights and for contributing to and benefitting from economic, social, cultural, and political development. The June 2011 Biannual Report provides the following statistics for the bilingual classes being implemented in grades 1, 2, and 3 in the six schools:

* 140 students, including 78 girls (55%) receiving bilingual instruction in grade 1
* 118 students, including 69 girls (58%) receiving bilingual instruction in grade 2
* 117 students, including 57 girls (49%) receiving bilingual instruction in grade 3

Bending Bamboo is improving the quality of education by providing new facilities and materials, offering relevant content through its life skills instruction, and training teachers in child-friendly practices.

Although empowerment does not appear to be a primary focus, Bending Bamboo is helping to empower girls. Activities include early childhood programs that free girls from childcare responsibilities, village committees that develop materials for girl-supporting programs, and advocacy workshops that help to build the community perception of the importance of education for school-age girls.

**Figure 7. Bending Bamboo Activities That Address the PCTFI Common Indicators Framework**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CIF Elements** | **Sub-categories** | | |
| **Attainment** | **Completion**  *Instruction in local language and Khmer* | **Persistence/Retention**  *Instruction in local language and Khmer* | **Achievement**  *Instruction in local language and Khmer* |
| **Equality** | **Community Education Perception**  *Involvement of girls in school*  *Advocacy workshops* | **Teacher Gender**  *Female teachers* | **Children’s Reception of Educational Equality and Equity**  *ECD* |
| **Quality** | **Suitable Educational**  **Environment**  *Construction of ECD/Life skill Centers* | **Relevant Content**  *Life skills* | **Child-Centered Processes**  *Teacher training in child-friendly practices* |
| **Empowerment** | **Support Strategic Relations**  *Advocacy workshops* | **Girls’ Agency**  *Life skills*  *Research* | **Structural Environment for Girls**  *Advocacy* |

### Fact Checking

MSI identified a number of findings concerning the implementation of Bending Bamboo and the CIF. A list of the MSI findings and AC’s verification of those findings is provided in Figure 8.

**Figure 8. Selected MSI Findings and AC Verification of Bending Bamboo**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **MSI Findings** | **AC Verification** |
| Noticeable effect on access and participation | Agree |
| Lack of female teachers | Program reports 20% female teachers throughout primary school program and 100% female teachers in ECD. CO acknowledges difficulty in recruiting women from indigenous communities to teach. |
| Separated seating | CO acknowledges separate seating, which is attributed to girls’ preference, not teacher assignment. |
| Teacher-directed methodologies | Teachers are being trained, but may not use student-centered methodologies 100% of the time. Training is ongoing. |
| Seconding of government personnel to Bending Bamboo positive | Agree |
| Strength and results of partnerships/coalition with other development organizations questioned | CARE Cambodia has had long-standing partnerships with UNICEF and UNESCO. |
| Staff wants more support and training and understanding of project | Need was confirmed. CARE Cambodia noted the “long road of capacity building for marginalized ethnic minority staff.” |
| Excessive amount of personnel | Cannot judge |
| Life skills program problematic; should be replaced with mentoring component | Integration into formal school curriculum minimizes problem. Program can be enhanced with more generic life skills, leadership training, and mentoring. |
| Ongoing issues with sourcing TA | Acknowledged, noting that recruiting consultants to remote Cambodia is difficult. |
| Good working relationships with other organizations | CARE Cambodia has had long-standing partnerships with UNICEF and UNESCO. |

### Conclusions

The evaluators’ overall impression is that many of Bending Bamboo’s program elements address the PCTFI CIF. In the abstract, Bending Bamboo’s graduated, integrated bilingual education model appears to be a strong support for girls’ attainment and equality, inspiring girls to enroll, persist, and complete primary school and continue to the next level. Because it frees boys and girls to attend school, the ECD component also supports girls’ attainment as well as girls’ equality in primary schools. The enrollment figures bear this out. The facilities, materials, life skills instruction, and training for teachers improve the environment for learning, the instructional processes, and the relevance of the information, thereby improving quality. Performance data would show how much students are learning. The research activity is designed to document any changes in achievement. Advocacy efforts push for and support girls’ inclusion.

## B. Global Impact to Date: Addressing PCTFI’s Global Objectives

Progress towards PTCFI’s five global objectives – innovation programming, knowledge generation, cross-sectoral innovation, learning innovation, and global positioning – show the global impact of PTCFI to date.

### Findings

For innovation programming, Bending Bamboo offers a full-range of activities, including locally-developed instructional programs in early childhood, bilingual education, and life skills; child-friendly teacher training for state school teachers to teach upper primary curriculum; and awareness raising to inspire a more equitable share of the division of labor at home between boys and girls. Products being developed under the program include an early childhood development curriculum and a program outline for the identified life skills. Bilingual materials, developed through other funds, are available for use.

For knowledge generation, CARE Cambodia sites comparative research on the academic achievements of indigenous students in oral Khmer, written Khmer, and math. The comparison group consists of schools with indigenous students in Khmer state schools in similar circumstances (classroom observations, using PCTFI common instruments, PLA on the workload of girls). For learning innovations, they list visits to other countries, manuals, teacher guides of the bilingual education model, and modules for ECD training. Global positioning activities listed include conferences in Chicago and Senegal, three international conferences on multi-lingual education, membership of Asia MLE Work Group to promote mother tongue education, and presentations at various international education events.

### Conclusions

Bending Bamboo addresses most, but not all of the PCTFI global objectives. Although the program interventions may not be new ideas, they do represent innovative programming for the isolated areas of Cambodia. New knowledge is being generated through the research on the relationship of instruction in Khmer and mathematics proficiency. The integrated life skills component provides some cross-sectoral exchange with standard school subjects. With printed documents, a multitude of presentations, and the bilingual education program being adopted by the Ministry for use in some formal schools, Bending Bamboo may be positioning CARE as an innovator in bilingual education.

**Figure 9. Bending Bamboo: Achieving PCTFI’s Five Global Objectives**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **PCTFI Global Objectives** | **Early Childhood Development** | **Bilingual Education** | **Life Skills** |
| Innovative Programming | x | x | x |
| Knowledge Generation |  | x |  |
| Cross-sectoral Innovation |  |  | x |
| Learning Innovation | In progress | x[[4]](#footnote-4) | x |
| Global Positioning |  | x |  |

## C. Preparing Girls to Learn and Lead: Advancing CARE’s Power Within Initiative

Power Within is based on the premise that success in three domains -- girls’ primary school completion, girls’ leadership skills development, and advocacy and support for girls’ rights -- will result in empowered girls, which in turn should reduce child poverty around the world.

The Power Within theory of change for girls’ leadership development is as follows:

Development of leadership

Competencies for girls

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Girls’ Primary School Completion | + | Girls’  Leadership  Skills  Development | **X** | Advocacy and Support for Girls’ Rights | = | Leadership Development |

Ten “pathways” guide and measure progress through these three domains (see Figure 10).

### Findings

CARE Cambodia and AC agree that Bending Bamboo addresses the first domain, “Increase the number of girls completing primary school” and Domain 3, “Advocate for the rights of girls,”. For Domain 3, AC concluded that the Bending Bamboo design has no specific activities that provide role models or champions for girls. CARE Cambodia pointed out, however, that Bending Bamboo is producing role models for other girls in the program. Girls who have gone through this system are becoming role models when they go to the secondary schools, where girls' clubs are being established. Female students from the bilingual program have now entered the Regional Teacher Training College. Young female indigenous persons who have been trained as the ECD facilitators are role models for their students. CARE has built the capacity of the Village Women Committees who also serve as role models in these communities. While these girls and young women may be models for Bending Bamboo students, they are not participating in a structured, organized program where they interact with the Bending Bamboo students on a regular basis and/or provide guidance about learning, careers, or other topics. Therefore, AC maintains its position that Bending Bamboo does not have specific activities that provide role models or champions for girls. Program planners might want to explore the development of an organized way for the girls and young women who have successfully completed Bending Bamboo activities to give back.

CARE Cambodia and AC agree that Bending Bamboo activities do not address Domain 2, “Build girls’ leadership skills.

**Figure 10. Bending Bamboo’s Adherence to Power Within Pathways**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Pathways** | **CARE Cambodia Rating** | **AC Rating** |
| **Domain of Change: Increase the Number of Girls Completing Primary School** |  |  |
| 1. Equitable, Quality Education: All children have access to quality primary education | yes | yes |
| 2. Social Transitions: Education available to learners prior to and after primary | yes | yes |
| 3. Learning Opportunities for Older Girls: Primary options available for girls who have never enrolled or dropped out | yes | yes |
| 4. Gender-Sensitive Policies and Programs: Programs are developed and implemented | yes | yes |
| **Domain of Change: Build Girls’ Leadership Skills** |  |  |
| 5. Diverse Extracurricular Activities for Girls: Girls provided complementary activities to build leadership competencies | no | no |
| 6. Social Networks of Girls: Safe spaces are available for girls to network with other girls | no | no |
| 7. Girls’ Participation in Civic Action: Girls take action to bring about positive change in their world | no | no |
| **Domain of Change: Advocate for the Rights of Girls** |  |  |
| 8. Attention to Harmful Traditional Practices: Communities transform traditional practices that perpetuate gender inequities | yes | yes |
| 9. Reduction of Risk and Vulnerability: Risks and vulnerabilities for girls are reduced by the mitigation of underlying causes of poverty | yes | yes |
| 10. Role Models and Champions for Girls: Girls have role models, mentors, and champions for their rights | yes | indirectly |

It should be noted that at the time of the original design of Bending Bamboo, there was no requirement to address the pathways of Power Within. This is something that has been required in 2011. Note also that the age group of the Bending Bamboo (ages 6-12) is younger than the target group for the Power Within signature program.

### Conclusions

By attracting and retaining more indigenous girls into state primary schools, Bending Bamboo’s bilingual education interventions and advocacy efforts are helping to improve girls’ primary school completion worldwide. Each one of the major interventions – early childhood education, bilingual education, and life skills education -- supports girls’ rights to attend school, achieve, and return to their communities to be productive citizens.

Leadership skills development and girls’ empowerment activities appear weak, however. Very little leadership content or practical application is evident in the bilingual or life skills instruction. AC also saw no evidence of support groups, mentorships, or self-esteem building activities for girls. CARE Cambodia reports that youth clubs are being established in all lower secondary schools, and that there is a selection or primary schools to promote girls’ leadership skills, but very little has been done to date.

## Project Orientation to Program Approach

In CARE USA’s Brief #5, the program approach is defined as, “A *coherent set of initiatives* by CARE and our allies that involves *a long-term commitment to specific marginalized and vulnerable groups* to achieve. This goes beyond the scope of projects to achieve *positive changes in human conditions, in social positions and in enabling environment*.” (Italics added to key words).

AC sees that Bending Bamboo is advancing the program approach. Bending Bamboo certainly is coherent set of initiatives. It is logically organized, according to the situational analysis and the intended goals and objectives. It has established collaborative relationships with various organizations. The effort invested in having the bilingual education and ECD models institutionalized by the MoEYS suggests a goal of long-term adoption of program elements.

By providing equitable and quality education, Bending Bamboo also supports CARE Cambodia’s Marginalised Ethnic Minorities (MEM) Program, a comprehensive effort that offers equitable and quality social services, ownership of resources, and responsive governance to the most marginalised ethnic minorities who are vulnerable to dealing with changing contexts, especially women and girls. MEM helps the most vulnerable to enjoy their rights, fully participate in culturally diverse Cambodian society, and equitably benefit from development.

# IV. Looking to the Future: Recommendations

## Suggested Changes to Project Direction and Execution

MSI’s findings related to project direction and execution and AC’s verification of those elements are summarized in Figure 11.

**Figure 11. MSI and AC Findings Concerning Bending Bamboo Project Direction and Execution**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **MSI Findings** | **AC Verification** |
| A number of solid processes, but implementation is not difficult when there is money in a resource-poor environment | Financial resources do help in areas with little funding, but effort should not be undervalued |
| Need to take sustainability and exit strategy seriously at this time | Adoption of bilingual education by Ministry represents “the main plank of CARE’s efforts to ensure sustainability.” (See sustainability discussion later in this chapter) |
| Viability of HCEP schools questioned, given food and land tenure insecurity | CO supports continued efforts to provide education despite insecurities. AC supports as well as long as staff and student safety is not compromised. |
| Mother tongue instruction questioned, based on MIDEC analysis and lack of parental support | Instruction in mother tongue, Khmer, and English are being debated. |
| Need sound research agenda | CO reports that research agenda has raised high expectations in the bilingual community, both nationally and internationally, including with UNICEF and UNESCO. |
| Add a mentoring program | AC notes an absence of self-esteem building or social support for girls. |

AC offers the following recommendations.

*Continue instruction in local language and Khmer.* As noted in the table above, MSI challenged the emphasis on mother tongue instruction. In its mid-term evaluation of Bending Bamboo, MSI noted that Government schools teach English in grade 6, and that given the probability that learning English would make students more competitive for the “job market,” assisting the Government to help indigenous ethnic minority students gain English language skills seemed to be “a sensible area for project expansion.” One reviewer questioned these positions, citing that many children might not travel beyond their neighboring villages as adults.

During telephone interviews, Cambodia staff members confirmed that community members want to see instruction in the native language and English. They feel that community elders want their children to know the national language so that as adults they will be able to continue their schooling (where English is required), and/or communicate with mainstream society. Khmer and English both are needed for tourism and economic development. More language capability also opens up more opportunities for jobs with NGOs, more and more of which are reaching out to smaller, more remote areas. They may want to employ indigenous people, but they need those who can communicate with project staff and internationals, as well as their own community members. Thus, a mother tongue, Khmer, and English are all considered important for employment.

AC acknowledges the usefulness of all three languages but feels that having children learn two languages by grade three is more than teachers or students could handle. AC therefore recommends that Bending Bamboo continue its efforts to provide instruction in Khmer and the mother tongues from grades one to three, and consider supporting English instruction in the upper grades. This would not involve the Bending Bamboo bilingual classes directly, but might impact the schools where Bending Bamboo is operating.

*Expand the life skills topics.* The topics currently included are very specific to the work that local girls are engaged in but may not prepare them for the world of work outside of their purview. Life skills education could include more general life and leadership skills like decision making, planning, problem solving, and communication. Planners are encouraged to review the life skills outlined by other development organizations and consider modifying the topics and related materials accordingly. For more details about the life skills and their definitions, visit [www.unodc.org/pdf/youthnet/action/message/escap\_peers\_07.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/pdf/youthnet/action/message/escap_peers_07.pdf)

*Add activities that support girls in their participation in school*. Support groups or a mentoring component could further encourage participation, achievement, and goal setting, and strengthen the quality of impact.

## Opportunities for Sustainability, Scale Up, and Greater Impact

MSI identified five major issues (see Figure 12).

**Figure 12. MSI and AC Findings Related to Opportunities for Sustainability, Scale-Up,**

**and Greater Impact**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **MSI Finding** | **AC Findings** |
| No sustainability exit strategy; also the HCEP II exit strategy hinges on establishment of an NGO composed of CARE staff. | See below |
| Government interested in CARE getting involved in ECED | Confirmed |
| English required in grade 6 | Parent-reported responses support this idea |
| Importance of progression through secondary school | Progression is occurring (see below) |
| Little evidence that model is replicable | CARE Cambodia feels that it is replicable |

AC agrees that an exit strategy is needed. While we do see evidence that plans are underway, we nevertheless agree that additional work should be done.

AC agrees that progression to secondary school is important. CARE Cambodia offers documentation that a system is in place to support advancement to secondary school in Bending Bamboo. For four years, CARE has sponsored a CFSS (Child Friendly Secondary Schools) project. This project works in 11 lower secondary schools in the district towns of the province, and three of these schools accept graduates from HCEP primary schools. This year has seen seven (four girls) of the first graduates from year 9 proceed on to the Primary Teacher’s Training College in Stung Treng. These seven graduates started grade 1 in HCEP schools in 2003. In addition, 17 year-9 graduates proceeded on to year-10 studies at the senior high school in Ban Lung. Although not reported by CARE Cambodia, AC assumes that because of the close relationship of HCEP and Bending Bamboo schools, these schools also would accept Bending Bamboo students.

CARE Cambodia also offered data to support that, contrary to MSI’s opinion, bilingual education in general, and Bending Bamboo specifically, is demonstratively replicable. From the original six HCEP schools in 2003, the number of bilingual education schools has increased significantly and bilingual education is more widely accepted (see Figure 13).

**Figure 13. Progress Made in Mainstreaming Bilingual Education**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Activity** | **2003** | **2011** | **2012** |
| Number of bilingual schools. | 6 | 30 | 32 |
| Number of ethnic minority teachers trained by CARE | 13 | 134 | 164 |
| Number of ethnic minority children receiving bilingual education | 278 | 2307 | 2889 |
| Number of ethnic minority languages used in formal education programs. | 2 | 4 | 4 |
| Number of remote provinces conducting formal bilingual programs | 1 | 3 | 4 |

All this progress is a result of replication by MoEYS. Based on these data, it seems clear that Bending Bamboo can be replicated. The question for consideration may be whether Bending Bamboo can be maintained or continue to be replicated without significant outside funding.

AC offers the following recommendations.

*Continue working to institutionalize the Bending Bamboo bilingual education model state-run system.* As outlined in the bi-annual report, CARE Cambodia already has made advances in sustaining the bilingual education model. Once considered “annex state schools,” the six Bending Bamboo schools are already being treated like state-run schools. The land that these schools are built on has been registered as ministry land. The schools receive materials and school improvements, and some staff are allocated to each site. In addition, CARE is outlining a workshop with MoEYS to develop a five-year operational plan “to ensure a well planned and properly resourced future for the bilingual education.” Steps are being taken. Nevertheless, as also reported in the biannual report, “the idea of bilingual education continues to be a politically sensitive issue and is fragile at best, and there remains a great deal of diplomatic advocacy work to be undertaken to ensure a pro-bilingual educational ‘perspective shift’ takes place.” Readers are referred to the biannual reports for more details on this.

*Develop post-PCTFI operations plan.* Sustaining the program post-PCTFI requires plans for a number of practical issues, such as materials production (for those materials that will become damaged or lost), training for new staff, and technical support/in-service training for those who have questions or need support. Bending Bamboo staff could work with government contacts to work out details.

*Develop guidelines for determining whether a community is eligible for bilingual instruction.* One area of particular concern is replicating the model in other isolated, indigenous communities. Despite the potential impact of teaching the mother tongue and the national language, providing instruction – and the related reading materials – in several languages has cost implications. The Highland Communities Program 2010 Annual Report reports that the Resource Production Unit, operating in collaboration with International Corporation Cambodia, developed textbooks and teaching materials in four indigenous languages--Tampuen, Kreung, Phnong, and Kavet--and has plans to add two new languages: the Brao language and two dialects of Kuy. In 2010, the Resource Production Unit had 63 books and 31 posters in five different languages for production! This level of production is amazing, but labor intensive. Producing reading materials for multiple grades in multiple languages means more writing, editing, and proofing, more reproduction and distribution.

One example of this is reported in the Bending Bamboo Jan-June 2011 Bi-annual Report, where based on Dr. Carol Benson’s evaluation of the replication of bilingual education, representatives from the POEs in Kratie and Preah Vihear made plans to start implementing bilingual education in the 2012 academic year. As stated in the report, “Even this modest expansion into five schools in two extra provinces presents CARE with considerable curriculum development issues, as the five schools chosen by the POEs actually means two extra languages. CARE is now faced with the challenge of preparing curriculum materials in these languages to be ready for classroom use by December 2011.” (CARE n.d.(a), p. 12). It may not be possible or reasonable to develop bilingual programs for every existing language. Clear, objective guidelines should be developed and available.

*Develop strategies and materials that communities can use to develop their own bilingual education programs.* It is this reviewer’s opinion that given the time and labor involved in developing materials in new languages, the best chances for scale-up and replicability would be in integrating the Bending Bamboo bilingual education approach in other schools/areas that use one or more of the local languages already included in the program. To promote replicability in communities with other indigenous languages, CARE could create a training manual or workbook documenting the process used in developing local language materials and/or establish a team of trainers, who could visit other areas and introduce the process but not assume responsibility for the writing, editing, and production. The kinds and amounts of materials needed for the program could be reconsidered. Perhaps more materials that can be used with small and large groups, as opposed to materials for individual students, could be incorporated.

*Consider alternative ways to approach bilingual education.* With or without an abundance of print materials, it is important to remember the overriding goal of any bilingual education program: to create an environment where teachers are able to communicate with all children in the classroom and where the children enrolled feel welcome, can understand what is being taught, and can relate to the content being presented. A new direction would be to change the emphasis of the materials to make use of more visuals and/or develop bilingual documents that include both languages.

*Involve formal school teachers in bilingual education.* The training for bilingual education and for child-friendly instruction already includes HCEP and Bending Bamboo schools. Plans are underway to include other formal school teachers as well, so that any formal school classroom will be exposed to the child-centered teaching practices, life skills, and strategies for making classrooms more welcoming to children who do not speak the national language. These plans should be developed, and, where possible, implemented.

*Complete the design for the ECD bilingual model of instruction.* Despite six newly constructed ECD centers, each complete with furnishings, equipment, materials, trained facilitators, and supportive community members, sustainability after PCTFI could still present some challenges.

Funds will be needed for staffing, upkeep, and maintenance. Community members are working on a detailed curriculum, which may be culturally relevant, but still might need the input of a technical expert with background in curriculum development and developmentally-appropriate practices.

One opportunity for sustainability of the ECD component, however, is the strong link with the MoYES, which has already expressed interest in a bilingual model for ECD. MSI sees the increasing engagement with government as positive and recommends TA in policy development to support this. AC concurs. CARE should seek technical experts who know bilingual education and developmentally-appropriate ECD and complete the curriculum for government consideration.

## Tools, Methods, Partners, or Other Resources

*Review and, where appropriate, revise reporting documents*. MSI reported a variety of concerns about methods, reports, and other program management tools: the situational analysis process that led to the inclusion of life skills; no use of standard project design and management tools; the absence of a good description of activities and number of participants in the program reports; a narrative form of reporting against CIF, which does not enable an understanding of the cumulative effects of the project; and no plan for sustainability or an exit strategy. They recommend that CARE Cambodia improve project documentation, including visuals and quantative data, use a logistical framework or other design/management tool, develop a risk management matrix, develop a sustainability strategy, and conduct further collaboration with the Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MWA).

CARE responded that the situational analysis was very well received during the presentation to UNESCO and UNICEF, and that the document has been sent countless times to NGOs who request information about Cambodia’s northeast region. MSI, in fact does agree that the situational analysis was well written. AC also agrees that the reports are well presented. Although detailed, however, AC nevertheless notes the absence of some valuable information in the reports. For example, AC could not easily locate the numbers of students or girls, per grade, in the Bending Bamboo bilingual program or life skills classes, or the total number of students enrolled in the early childhood program. Those kinds of numbers are important for determining program effectiveness and impact. In addition, Bending Bamboo outcomes are often combined with HCEP data and data from other programs that are a part of the Highland Communities Program. It is often difficult to distinguish what is Bending Bamboo from other non-PTCFI initiatives.

CARE Cambodia responds that HCEP and Bending Bamboo are purposely “inextricably linked,” as this was a requirement of funding from PCTFI, and that considerable thought has gone and continues to go into ensuring these links are not negatively impacted as HCEP and BB continue to evolve.” Nevertheless, AC feels that some adjustments should be considered.

*Continue to cultivate relationships with other organizations.* During its document review and interviews with CARE Cambodia staff, AC noted that CARE Cambodia works or has worked collaboratively with the following organizations:

* *Cambodia Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sports:* co-facilitated ECD workshops and worked collaboratively with CARE Cambodia to develop a National Action Plan for Early Childhood. Also accepted the integration of bilingual education and life skills into the state school curriculum (MSI questions, however, whether community-sourced teachers will be taken on by the government.)
* *International Corporation Cambodia*: Collaborated with the HCEP Resource Production Unit to develop textbooks and teaching materials in four indigenous languages, with plans to add two more.
* *Joel Bassat Family Charitable Organization:* Funded solar panels on ECD/Life Skill training centers.
* *University of Minnesota and Australian Catholic University:* Working in collaboration with CARE Cambodia to conduct research on instruction in Khmer and mathematics proficiency.

This type of collaborative activity, which is in keeping with the program nature of PCTFI, may contribute to sustainability. CARE Cambodia can approach these and other organizations about assuming some of the program responsibilities as it plans its phase out.

# Bibliography

“Bending Bamboo Project.” Power Point.

Benson, Carol. “Evaluation of the State of Bilingual Education in Cambodia. Undertaken November 2010 to March 2011 for MOEYS with UNICEF Support” (Final Version). 25 April 2011.

CARE Cambodia Staff. 2011(a). “The HCEP Bilingual Model.”

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_. 2011(b). “Life Skills Book Titles/Topics.”

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_. 2011(c). Telephone & Skype interviews with Cynthia Prather.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_. 2011(d). Email responses, December 2011.

“Cambodia Field Series Topic – Collaborating with Government in the Context of a Highly Centralized System.”

CARE. n.d (a). Brief #5: Designing Programs.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_. N.d.(b). “CARE Cambodia Bending Bamboo Bi-annual Report, January-June 2011.”

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ n.d.(c). “CARE Cambodia Bending Bamboo Bi-annual Report, January-June 2010.”

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_n.d.(d). “CARE Cambodia Bending Bamboo Bi-annual Report, Jul-Dec 2009.”

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_n.d.(e). “CARE Cambodia Bending Bamboo Bi-annual Report Jan-Jun 2009.”

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_n.d.(f). “CARE Cambodia Bending Bamboo Report:  Assembly on the Workload of Girls, June 22-23, 2011.”

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_n.d.(g). “Highland Community Education Program: Bending Bamboo. Situational Analysis 2008.”

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_n.d.(h). “Insights in Innovation: Education Findings from the Patsy Collins Trust Fund Initiative. January 2007-February 2009.”

CARE International in Cambodia. “Highlands Communities Program, Annual Report 2010.”

Management Systems International. 2011. “Mid-term Evaluation Report: CARE-Cambodia Bending Bamboo Project.” May 13, 2011.

# Appendices

## Appendix A: Questionnaire on CO Involvement in the Five Objectives of the PCTFI Between March 2009 and the Present

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Objectives** | Activities,  Jan. ’07-Feb. ‘09 | Please list any activities that you have taken part in or have awareness of in your country in the period between March ’09-Sept./Oct. 2011 |
| **1Innovation Programming**: Two ten-year longitudinal cohorts | **Cohort One**: Cambodia, Honduras, Mali, Tanzania  **Cohort Two**: Bangladesh, Ghana, India, Malawi  **Advocacy Grants Program:** Bolivia, Ecuador, El Salvador, Indonesia, Perú, Serbia & Togo | The Bending Bamboo (BB) activities consist of:  - Early Childhood Development (ECD) curriculum development with senior indigenous women.  - Pre-service and in-service training of ECD facilitators.  - Construction of ECD centers, school and wells and latrines.  - ECD classes three mornings a week.  - Implementation of the bilingual model in the state schools in the BB target area.  - Mainstreaming appropriate life skills into the bilingual education model.  - Upgrading in-service workshops for state school teachers to teach upper primary curriculum.  - Developing strategies to come to a more equitable share of the division of labor at home between boys and girls (Note: part of this was the development and publication of a book in several languages on workloads of girls and the consultancy and staff costs for the development of the book and the printing of the book were funded by CARE Australia from the ANCP funds (AusAID). |
| 2 **Knowledge Generation**: | **Development and testing of the CIF.**  **Set of strategic studies:** Kenya, Peru, & Ecuador | Comparative research on the academic achievements of indigenous students in Oral Khmer, Written Khmer and math. The comparison group are schools with indigenous students in Khmer state schools in similar circumstances (classrooms observations, using PCTFI common instruments, PLA on the workload for girls).  (Note: the research on mathematics is conducted by a researcher from Australia Catholic University, funded by the Australian government program Endeavour). |
| 3 **Cross-sectoral Innovation:** | **An HIV/AIDS & education pilot:** Burundi & Mozambique  **Integration of the PCTFI program with existing community-based village savings/loans and reproductive health:** Tanzania | n/a |
| 4 **Learning Innovation:** | **Scholarship Fund:** staff attend and present at conferences and visit other CARE projects.  **Use of CARE staff as translators in PCTFI workshops.**  **Manual Publication:** *Perspectives: Using a broad-based approach to conduct a Comprehensive situational analysis* | *Travel?*  Visits to Egypt, Honduras, Mali, Tanzania, London, India.  *Manuals? Dialogues with Data (2011)? Advocacy for Education (2011)?*  Teachers’ Guides for Grades 1 and 2 of the bilingual education model.  (Note: the actual development of the books and the staff costs were provided through ANCP funding)  Modules for ECD training.  Modules for the delivery of ECD (under development) |
| 5 **Global Positioning:** | **Partnership with MIDEC.**  **Participation in key forums and global initiatives.** | CIES Conference, Chicago, USA, March 2010 (presentation)  UNGEI Conference, Senegal, May 2010 (presentation)  Three International Conferences on Multi Lingual Education and development (presentations, co-hosting, co-organizers) (Note: travel and accommodation paid by PCTFI funds, but the USD 10,000 contribution to the conference was funded by the ANCP funds).  Membership of Asia MLE Working Group to promote mother tongue education in Bangkok, Thailand (quarterly)  Presentations at the Royal University of Phnom Penh.  Presentations at the NGO Education Partnership (NEP) at national level to profile the PCTFI work.  Presentations at EDUCAM at national level to raise the profile of the PCTFI work.  Participation in many national events in development, indigenous people, education and women’ development. |

## Appendix B: Questionnaire on Country Participation in the Ten Power Within Pathways

It is not expected, nor would it be possible for a CO to make all ten pathways priorities. Please indicate how you believe your office is working on each pathway.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Domain of Change: Increase the number of girls completing primary school** | | | | | | |
| **Pathways** | **Level of Engagement (Check all that apply)** | | | | **Description of activities** | |
|  | None | Advocacy | Partnership/support | Direct  Implemen-  tation | How is your CO addressing this pathway? Please list, very briefly, the activities you are carrying out. | |
| **1 Equitable, Quality Education**: All children have access to quality primary education. |  | X | X | X | - Implementing projects on bilingual primary education (funding provided by PCTFI, ANCP, Maitri (CARE Aus)  - partnership with Development Partners on up scaling bilingual education  - contracted by the Ministry to provide technical advice on bilingual education up scaling (funds from Ministry)  - member of Asia MLE Working Group in Thailand to promote this education in the SE Asia region | |
| **2 Social Transitions**: Education available to learners prior to and after primary. |  |  |  | X | * Culturally appropriate ECD program for indigenous children * Child Friendly Secondary Schools project( teacher in-service, scholarships) (funding provided by ANCP) * Scholarships for tertiary education for indigenous students (CARE USA:NWCC, Ping Y Tai foundation) | |
| **3 Learning Opportunities for Older Girls**: Primary options available for girls who have never enrolled or dropped out. |  | X |  | X | * ECD facilitators (teachers) * Return to school as a result of implementation of bilingual education (funding provided by PCTFI, ANCP, Maitri (CARE Aus) * Return to school after (early) marriage | |
| **4 Gender-Sensitive Policies and Programs:** Programs are developed and implemented. |  |  |  | X | * Workload of girls’ activities. Ongoing dialogue during visits and workshops with stakeholders on a more equitable division of   labor at home between boys and girls (including textbook on this topic in several languages (ANCP funding))  The Ministry of Education has promulgated the Child Friendly Schools policy. One of the six dimensions is on Gender. The Bending  Bamboo project meets the dimensions of this Policy. Special grants are provided per school to address the policy.  *Any government- supported gender-sensitive activities in schools?* | |
| **Domain of Change: Build Girls’ Leadership Skills** | | | | | | |
| **Pathways** | **Level of Engagement (Check all that apply)** | | | | **Description of activities** | |
|  | None | Advocacy | Partnership/support | Direct  Implemen-tation | How is your CO addressing this pathway? Please list, very briefly, the activities you are carrying out. | |
| **5 Diverse Extracurricular Activities for Girls**: Girls provided complementary activities to build leadership competencies. |  |  | X | *X* | In all lower secondary schools in the districts of Ratanakiri Province, youth clubs are being established. There are separate  Groups for girls to provide ‘safe space’. (ANCP funding)  In cooperation with VSO (an international voluntary organization) a sports program is rolled out in the secondary schools and a  Selection of primary schools to promote (girls) leadership skills. | |
| **6 Social Networks of** **Girls:** Safe spaces are available for girls to network with other girls. |  |  | X | X | See above. Also this activity is done in partnership with VSO. | |
| **7 Girls’ Participation in Civic Action**: Girls take action to bring about positive change in their world. |  |  |  |  |  | |
| **Domain of Change: Advocate for the Rights of Girls** | | | | | | |
| **Pathways** | **Level of Engagement (Check all that apply)** | | |  | **Description of activities** | |
|  | None | Advocacy | Partnership/  support | Direct  Implementation | How is your CO addressing this pathway? Please list, very briefly, the activities you are carrying out. | |
| **8 Attention to Harmful Traditional Practices**: Communities transform traditional practices that perpetuate gender inequities. |  | X |  | *X* | *Harmful practices identified?*   * *workload of girls* * *marriages and motherhood at very early ages*   *Mechanisms to address these practices?*   * *Presentations at government workshops* * *Assembly with community members / government officials (CARE Australia, CARE USA and ANCP funds)* * *Traditional song and dance (CARE USA)* * *Street theatre (CARE Australia)* * *On going dialogue with elders in the communities* |  |
| **9 Reduction of Risk and Vulnerability:** Risks and vulnerabilities for girls are reduced by the mitigation of underlying causes of poverty. |  |  |  |  | *Risks and vulnerabilities identified?*  High domestic workloads for girls, and working on plantations during harvests.  *Mechanisms to address the risks and vulnerabilities?*  For the first issue, see above. The second one has been identified, but yet addressed apart from enrollment campaigns. |  |
| **10 Role Models and Champions for Girls**: Girls have role models, mentors and champions for their rights. |  |  |  |  |  |  |

## Appendix C: Telephone Interview Guidelines

(Estimated time: 1 hr)

Description of the components/activities

Adherence to PCTFI objectives

Adherence to Power Within Framework

Linkages/Partnerships with Other Programs

Suggestions for Replication/Scale Up?

Success Stories – Ideas?

Actions/Next Steps

## Appendix D[[5]](#footnote-5): Overview of Teacher Training Workshops for Bilingual Community Teachers

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Date | Workshop | Participants | Enrolled | Attended | Content |
| 31/01/2011 | In-Service #2  *Cohort 1 – 9*  *Grade 1-6* | HCEP CT | 44/11 | 39/11 | -Welcome to CTs  -Academic upgrading (Khmer & Math vernacular language)  -Teaching evaluation  **-**Teaching Model  -Familiarization of Teacher Guide (Khmer Math social study vernacular language or Science)  -Roundtable meeting. |
| HCEP SST | 5/0 | 5/0 |
| POE RTK | 28/3 | 28/2 |
| POE RTK SST | 2/0 | 2/0 |
| POE MDK | 17/6 | 14/5 |
| POE ST | 24/1 | 20/1 |
| BB | 18/4 | 15/2 |
| **Total** | **138/25** | **123/21** |
| 14/03/2011 | Pre-Service #1  *Cohort 10* | HCEP CT | 0 | 0 | Welcome to CTs, Warm up & Game  Pre test ,Benefit of workshop  Photograph, Data Entry  Visit Care office  Academic upgrading (Khmer & Math vernacular language)  Roundtable meeting. |
| BB | 1/1 | 1/1 |
| POE RTK | 10/0 | 10/10 |
| POE ST | 8/4 | 8/4 |
| POE MDK | 5/1 | 5/1 |
| Kratie | 4/2 | 4/2 |
| Preah Vihear | 6/3 | 6/3 |
| **Total** | **34/11** | **34/11** |
| 28/03/2011 | In-Service #3  *Cohort 1 – 9*  *Grade 1 – 6* | HCEP CT | 44/11 | 37/9 | -Welcome to CTs  -Academic upgrading (Khmer & Math vernacular language)  -Book trial use evaluation.  -Familiarization of Teacher Guide (Khmer Math social study vernacular language)  -Roundtable meeting. |
| HCEP SST | 5/0 | 4/0 |
| POE RTK | 28/3 | 20/2 |
| POE RTK SST | 2/0 | 2/0 |
| POE MDK | 17/6 | 15/5 |
| POE ST | 24/1 | 22/1 |
| BB | 18/4 | 13/2 |
| **Total** | **138/25** | **113/19** |
| 25/04/2011 | Pre-Service #2  *Cohort 10* | HCEP CT | 0 | 0 | Welcome to CTs  Warm up & Game  -Mental Math  -Singing the Song  -Calendar  -Academic upgrading (Khmer & Math vernacular language) |
| BB | 2/2 | 2/2 |
| POE RTK | 10/0 | 10/0 |
| POE ST | 8/4 | 8/4 |
| POE MDK | 5/1 | 4/1 |
| POE Kratie | 4/2 | 4/2 |
| POE Preah Vihear | 6/3 | 5/3 |
| **Total** | **35/12** | **33/12** |
| 02/05/2011 | Pre-Service #3  *Cohort 10* | HCEP CT | 0 | 0 | -Welcome to CTs, Warm up & Game  -Mental Math  -Singing the Song  -Calendar  -Methodology: (Part 1: **THE CHILD AS LEARNER)**  -Roundtable meeting. |
| BB | 2/2 | 2/2 |
| POE RTK | 10/0 | 10/0 |
| POE ST | 8/4 | 8/4 |
| POE MDK | 5/1 | 4/1 |
| POE Kratie | 4/2 | 4/2 |
| POE Preah Vihear | 6/3 | 5/3 |
| **Total** | **35/12** | **33/12** |
| 30/05/2011 | Pre-Service #4  *Cohort 9* | HCEP CT | 0 | 0 | Welcome to CTs  Warm up & Game  -Mental Math  -Singing the Song  -Calendar  -Academic upgrading (Khmer & Math vernacular language) |
| BB | 2/2 | 2/2 |
| POE RTK | 10/0 | 8/0 |
| POE ST | 8/4 | 5/4 |
| POE MDK | 5/1 | 4/1 |
| POE Kratie | 4/2 | 1/1 |
| POE Preah Vihear | 6/3 | 6/3 |
| **Total** | **35/12** | **26/11** |
| 07/06/2010 | Pre-Service #5  *Cohort 9* | HCEP CT | 0 | 0 | -Welcome to CTs, Warm up & Game  -Mental Math  -Singing the Song  -Calendar  -Methodology: (Part 2: **WHAT IS THIS THING CALLED MATHEMATICS?**  -Roundtable meeting. |
| BB | 2/2 | 2/2 |
| POE RTK | 10/0 | 8/0 |
| POE ST | 8/2 | 5/4 |
| POE MDK | 5/1 | 4/1 |
| POE Kratie | 4/2 | 1/1 |
| POE Preah Vihear | 6/3 | 6/3 |
| **Total** | **35/12** | **26/11** |
| 27/06/2011 | In-Service #4  *Cohort 1-9*  *Grade 1 -6* | HCEP CT | 44/11 | 22/4 | Welcome to CTs  -Academic upgrading (Khmer & Math vernacular language)  -How to teach in reading and writing?  -How to ask question and answer?  -How to develop worksheet for student do?  -How to correct and give score to student worksheet?  -Familiarization of Teacher Guide (Khmer Math social study vernacular language)  -Roundtable meeting. |
| HCEP SST | 5/0 | 3/0 |
| POE RTK | 28/3 | 26/2 |
| POE RTK SST | 2/0 | 2/0 |
| POE MDK | 17/6 | 14/5 |
| POE ST | 24/1 | 20/1 |
| BB | 18/4 | 12/1 |
| **Total** | **138/25** | **113/19** |
|
|
|
|
|

**Topics covered during the in-service training workshops for State School Teachers in Bending Bamboo and HCEP schools.**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Date of workshops** | **Topics covered.** |
| March 2 - 3 | **Classroom Management and the Way Children Learn.**   * Child Friendly School Policy * What should a teacher in a child friendly classroom do / not do? * Child centred approaches to teaching and learning * How children learn. * Whole class, small groups, working pairs, individual work * Different children learn differently * Creating a learning environment on the classroom * What makes a good learning environment? * Action plans to improve the learning environment |
| April 26 - 28 | **Child Centred Teaching: Developing Questioning Skills (Part 1)**   * Child centred and teacher centred methodologies. * Four elements of child centred methodologies. * Introduction to questioning. * Different kinds of questions * Memory questions and thinking questions * Questioning in different subject areas * Eliciting answers to questions |
| June 1 – 3 | **Child Centred Teaching: Developing Questioning Skills (Part 2)**   * Classifying questions * Different kinds of questions; memory questions, understanding questions, critical thinking questions. * Developing questions using topics from the MoEYS social studies textbooks. * Simple research projects to develop critical thinking skills. * Develop a research task using the DO, TALK, RECORD, PRESENT framework. |

1. Adapted from completed questionnaire, “CO Involvement in the Five Objectives of the PCTFI Between March 2009 and the Present.” Submitted to Archer Consulting September 2011 (See Appendix A). [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. The problems around land grabbing and handing out of economic land concessions by the central government has caused huge problems for the indigenous communities in the northeast. Additionally, the deforestation continued on a large scale despite a ban of the Prime Minister. Communities became increasingly uncomfortable about discussing these matters with outsiders because community cohesions started to erode. Several community members were selling land without informing the elders. Several NGOs decided to postpone working on land issues in their projects. CARE followed suit. In the meantime, CARE has developed a comprehensive intervention in supporting communities to deal with land tenure. The proposal has been submitted for funding by CARE Austria. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Adapted from CARE Cambodia Staff. 2011(b). “Life Skills Book Titles.” [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Materials are being developed by the Resource Production Unit, which worked collaboratively with International Corporation Cambodia. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Source: CARE Cambodia Bending Bamboo Bi-annual Report, Jan-June 2011, pp. 13-15. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)