Safe Migration and Reduced Trafficking

SMART

END OF PROJECT EVALUATION REPORT
Contents

Abbreviations .................................................................................................................... 3
Project Data ......................................................................................................................... 4
Executive Summary ........................................................................................................... 5
1 Background ...................................................................................................................... 7
2 Methodology .................................................................................................................... 8
  2.1 Purpose and Scope of the Evaluation ........................................................................... 8
  2.2 Evaluation Methodology ........................................................................................... 8
  2.3 Limitations of the Evaluation Methodology ............................................................... 8
3 Key Findings and Results ............................................................................................... 9
  3.1 Relevance .................................................................................................................. 9
  3.2 Effectiveness ............................................................................................................ 9
    3.2.1 Overall Objective Indicators .............................................................................. 10
    3.2.2 Overall Objectives Progress ........................................................................... 10
    3.2.3 Result 1: Capacity Building ............................................................................. 11
    3.2.4 Result 2: Empowerment .................................................................................. 13
    3.2.5 Result 3: Advocacy ............................................................................................ 17
    3.2.6 Result 4: Monitoring, Learning and Evaluation .................................................. 18
  3.3 Efficiency .................................................................................................................. 18
  3.4 Sustainability ............................................................................................................ 19
  3.5 Impact ....................................................................................................................... 19
4 Conclusions and Recommendations ............................................................................. 19
  4.1 Conclusions and Lessons Learned ............................................................................ 19
  4.2 Recommendations .................................................................................................... 20
Summary of End of Project Results ................................................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
Annex A Key Informants .................................................................................................... 26
Annex B Interview Topic Guide ....................................................................................... 27
## Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CWPD</td>
<td>Cambodia Women for Peace and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KII</td>
<td>Key Informant Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOI</td>
<td>Ministry of Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOLVT</td>
<td>Ministry of Labor and Vocational Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOSVY</td>
<td>Ministry of Social Affairs Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOWA</td>
<td>Ministry of Women’s Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCCT</td>
<td>National Committee for Counter Trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMART</td>
<td>Safe Migration and Reduced Trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PC NCCT</td>
<td>Provincial Committee of the National Combat Trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PC STSLS</td>
<td>Provincial Committees on Suppression of Human Trafficking, Smuggling, Labour Exploitation, and Sexual Exploitation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Project Data

Name of beneficiary of grant contract:
CARE Österreich, Verein für Entwicklungszusammenarbeit und humanitäre Hilfe
(Association for Development Cooperation and Humanitarian Aid)

Name and title of the Contact person:
Karoline Ohler, Programme Officer Asia, Middle East and Europe, CARE Österreich

Name of partners in the Action:
Cambodia Women for Peace and Development (CWPD)

Title of the Action:
Safe Migration and Reduced Trafficking

Contract number:
EIDHR/2011/272-402 EuropeAid
2352-08/2012 Austrian Development Cooperation

Start date and end date of the reporting period:
01 March 2012–28 February 2015

Target country(ies) or region(s):
Cambodia - Prey Veng and Kampong Cham provinces

Final beneficiaries&/or target groups\(^1\) (if different) (including numbers of women and men):
young women and girls, young men, total approx 10,000

\(^1\) “Target groups” are the groups/entities who will be directly positively affected by the project at the Project Purpose level, and “final beneficiaries” are those who will benefit from the project in the long term at the level of the society or sector at large.
Executive Summary

CARE International in Cambodia implemented the Safe Migration and Reduced Trafficking (SMART) project between 1st March 2012 and 28 February, 2015 with funding from EuropeAid (EU). An end of project evaluation is required to evaluate the level of achievement and impact towards its expected goals and objectives and any lessons learned for future projects.

Migration, particularly for labour, is a growing phenomenon worldwide. However unsafe migration – including illegal migration, reliance on brokers and indebtedness – increases the risks of trafficking and other forms of exploitation. Cambodia is a relative newcomer to the management of labour migration; its policy and institutional framework is still weak, ineffective and lacking coherence. Migrants from Cambodia, both internal and external, are not sufficiently protected by its laws. Migrants and their families are under-informed on safe migration practices.

Recognising this, CARE in Cambodia started the SMART. The project’s overall objective was promote safe migration in order to reduce the incidence of human trafficking in Cambodia. Its specific objective was to strengthen the capacities of local authorities and civil society agencies at commune, district and provincial levels to prevent unsafe migration and trafficking; and to empower at-risk groups to make informed decisions.

The project was implemented in six districts within the two provinces of Prey Veng, Kampong Cham. The target groups include civil society, local authorities (duty bearers), volunteers who will promote safe migration awareness-raising, and community members. The final beneficiaries are community members who are most at risk of unsafe migration and trafficking, particularly young men and women.

Results of the project are successful. The project has had a significant impact on increased awareness of safe migration practices. In the project baseline survey, the majority of duty bearers did not demonstrate knowledge of safe migration procedures and lacked a systematized procedure. By project end targeted local authorities demonstrated increased knowledge and capacity to understand and deliver the projects key messages and refer when appropriate to services. Additionally collaboration had increased between key duty bearers and the community. A key success was the training of Focal Points to be key points of contact for information and support in the community. These Focal Points are Commune Committee for Women and Children Focal Points and will continue past the life of the project with increased knowledge and resources on safe migration.

Community members also were also more empowered to make informed choices about safe migration and report cases of trafficking. At the beginning of the project there was little understanding of migration risks beyond sex trafficking. Few in the community understood the legal paperwork for safe migration, or the risks of brokers without legal status. By the end of the project the community widely knew about legal documents, and where to seek advice if needed or report problems that occurred. This occurred through widespread distribution of key messages through multiple mechanisms (posters, Easy Cards, Radio, TV, community discussions, etc.).

The project is considered to be highly successful, as it met its results (See Reporting of Expected Results. Government and community support were high for the project demonstrated by the
partnerships to implement and requests for continuation during the final evaluation. Challenges in implementation were a result of partner capacity and some staff turnover resulting in need to increase technical support to the partner and delays in some activities although overall completion of actions were successful.

Key Recommendations include:

- Overall project implementation, and achievement of objectives was considered successful. However, in the future, a clear capacity assessment for implementing partners with strategies to address capacity gaps early is recommended to prevent delays in implementation.
- While the cost and processing time of legal documents for migration have been reduced these costs should continue to be reduced and procedures expedited to be most effective at preventing unsafe migration and trafficking. An increase in ‘One Stop Services’ for legal processing should be established to promote easy legal migration.
- Collaboration has increased at all levels, but efforts should continue to be promoted to support implementation of national policies at the subnational level and to provide information back to the national level on the current challenges faced in the community on migration. This collaboration should include the government and civil society organizations and not by-bass the provincial level.
- Resource centres are key mechanisms to promote safe migration and should be continued and expanded. High illiteracy including legal illiteracy means that migrants can be exploited easily and messages should be written in simple clear formats such as the Easy Cards or posters used in SMART. These mechanisms should be distributed more widely.
- While migration is clearly a part of the economic system in Cambodia, in the larger framework, building capacity of workers including literacy and vocational skills will increase their ability to protect themselves from unsafe migration and increase their ability to get a better paying job when they do migrate. Additionally responding to the issues resulting from migration including grandparents caring for children fulltime and having less support themselves is important.
- Community awareness on safe migration should continue to be widely disseminated. Clearly when a community was targeted with safe migration messaging, the local authorities reported a decrease in rates of illegal migration or trafficking. This awareness raising should be promoted through all possible mechanisms including community awareness and through national mechanisms.
- And while international migration is clearly significant and will continue it is important to note that migration internally in Cambodia brings its own risks and challenges and should be considered in any planning for safe migration prevention and response programs.
1 Background

CARE International in Cambodia began its Safe Migration and Reduced Trafficking (SMART) project on 1st March 2012 after funding for EUR 244,854.56 was approved by the EuropeAid (EU) and EUR 56,999.89 was approved by the Austrian Development Cooperation (ADA). The project’s overall objective is to promote safe migration in order to reduce the incidence of human trafficking in Cambodia. The project was implemented over three years. Its specific objective is to strengthen the capacities of local authorities and civil society agencies at commune, district and provincial levels to prevent unsafe migration and trafficking; and to empower at-risk groups to make informed decisions.

The project is being implemented in six districts within the two provinces of Prey Veng, Kampong Cham. The target groups include civil society, local authorities (duty bearers), volunteers who will promote safe migration awareness-raising, and community members. The final beneficiaries are community members who are most at risk of unsafe migration and trafficking, particularly young men and women.

The project uses strategies that recognise migration as an inevitable and growing feature in the global economy. With information about their rights, or lack of rights, in transit and in destination, people can make informed choices and they know who to turn to if and when in trouble.

The project activities aim to lead to increased awareness and understanding of safe migration practices through:

- **capacity building** of civil society and local authorities to enable improved consultation and joint action to deliver safe migration messages, and to respond to cases of trafficking;
- **empowerment** and training of volunteers to implement awareness raising activities;
- **advocacy** through policy dialogue, mass media campaigns and special events; and,
- **monitoring, learning and evaluation** through developing project-specific participatory assessment tools; conducting baseline survey; end of project evaluation, technical and reflection meetings in order that project lessons are effectively captured to inform future programming.

The SMART project is a partnership between CARE Cambodia and Cambodia Women for Peace and Development (CWPD). The project follows on from a previous CWPD project “Catalyzing Healthier Labour Migration” where the focus was on prevention of HIV and unsafe migration between Cambodia and Thailand. CWPD was formerly a part of PROMDAN, a partnership between agencies working in Thailand and Cambodia formed in response to a situation of uninformed labour migration in Cambodia and the need to develop health services suitable for Cambodian migrant workers in Thailand.

---

2 In the life cycle of the project Kampong Cham Province divided into two provinces. The new section is Tbong Khmum. This did not change the project target area as the provincial structures were being created.
2 Methodology

2.1 Purpose and Scope of the Evaluation
This end of project evaluation was conducted in the final month of the SMART project. The purpose of the evaluation was to evaluate the level of achievement toward its expected results. Findings from the evaluation will be used to gather lessons learned and inform the design of future projects.

2.2 Evaluation Methodology
The evaluation methodology included a mix of methods. A desk review of project reports with key data on project results and performance was conducted. Key project documents consulted included the SMART Baseline Survey, Quarterly and Annual Project reports and A Situational Analysis of Labour Migration in Cambodia and Lessons Learned from CARE’s SMART Project.

Qualitative methods included Key Informant Interviews (KII) and Focus Group Discussions (FGD) with key stakeholders at the national and subnational levels. Interview guides are available in Annex A. Interview questions are structured around measuring key project outcomes.

Data collected was then triangulated against findings from the project’s baseline and periodic reports. A narrative summary of key findings and results, assessed against the criteria of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability, was compiled. Conclusions and recommendations have been made to contribute to lessons learned and guide future work for CARE, partners and the donor.

2.3 Limitations of the Evaluation Methodology
The evaluation methodology is qualitative and responses of KII and FGDs must be taken at face value. A household survey was not carried out so results are measured based on the programme reports and information provided by the key informants.
3 Key Findings and Results

3.1 Relevance

The SMART project has been assessed to be highly relevant\(^3\) to national policies on safe migration and counter trafficking and to the situation of migration the target provinces of Prey Veng and Kampong Cham (later divided into two provinces – new area is called Tbong Kmum).

Relevant government policies related to labour migration and anti-trafficking are spread across multiple ministries including Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation; the Council of Ministers; the Ministry of Interior (MoI); and the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MoLVT). Additionally the Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MoWA), and Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation (MoSVY) target prevention and response safe migration and prevention of trafficking strategies.

A key coordinating body for actions and policies is the National Committee for Counter Trafficking (NCCT) led by the Ministry of Interior. The SMART project was strategically delivered through an implementation agreement with the Ministry of Interior as the leader in the NCCT. In 2012, the NCCT formed a national migration working group in collaboration with government, civil society and NGOs to discuss and review issues pertaining to labour migration and trafficking.

As a result of the agreement with the NCCT, SMART was clearly in line with government strategies and in fact targeted the improvement of the governments’ ability for implementation of national strategies at the subnational level through the Provincial Committee on Counter Trafficking, and further through the District and Commune Councils and Women and Children’s Committees at each level.

In order to fully understand the situation of migration a SMART Baseline Survey was completed that included a household survey that provided detailed information. This combined with other recent data and input from key line ministries and experts helped to set the target area. All these actions combined resulted in a highly relevant program.

3.2 Effectiveness

To assess the effectiveness\(^4\) of this project, the objectives, expected results and outputs and their indicators were reviewed. This review was completed using program reports and validated through KII and FGDs with relevant stakeholders.

**Overall Objective:** The overall objective of the project is to promote safe migration in order to reduce the incidence of human trafficking (domestic and international) in Cambodia.

\(^3\) Relevance concerns the extent to which a development initiative and its intended outputs or outcomes are consistent with national and local policies and priorities and the needs of intended beneficiaries

\(^4\) Effectiveness is a measure of the extent to which the initiative’s intended results (outputs or outcomes) have been achieved or the extent to which progress toward outputs or outcomes has been achieved

“The success of the SMART project is that it supported national policy implementation at the local level. Sometimes policies are just paper, but with SMART we were able to implement the policy and prevent unsafe migration”

CWPD Programme Staff
**Indicator:** The incidence of human trafficking and unsafe migration is reduced in selected provinces by the end of the project (See Impact).

**Specific Objective:** To strengthen the capacities of civil society agencies and local authorities (commune, district, provincial) to prevent unsafe migration and trafficking and empower at-risk groups to make informed decisions

### 3.2.1 Specific Objective Indicators

- Provincial Committees are in place and functioning with adequate participation
- Selected communities have increased access to and understanding of safe migration messages

### 3.2.2 Specific Objectives Progress

The project was clearly successful at building the capacity of civil society and local authorities to prevent unsafe migration and trafficking and empowering at-risk groups to make informed decisions.

“A monthly meeting is conducted to get reports and information from local authorities (10 districts). After receiving reports, we can resolve the problems. We also disseminate information about migration and human trafficking at the district level. In the case of women getting married to foreigners, we also had a meeting about this type of case as well.”

Provincial Committee

A clear strength of the project in building the capacity of civil society organizations and local authorities was its' partnership approach. In the first year the focus was on developing partnerships and relationships at all levels.

The project operated under the authority of a Memorandum of Understanding with the National Committee Secretariat to Combat Counter Trafficking (NCCT). Through this structure the project (and partners) worked in partnership with the Provincial Committees on Suppression of Human Trafficking, Smuggling, Labour Exploitation, and Sexual Exploitation (PC STSLS). During the life of the project the provincial (and national) STSLS transitioned to the Provincial (and national) Committee of the National Committee to Combat Trafficking (PC NCCT). Many of the project activities occurred under the previous structure, however continued as the new structure was put in place.

**Provincial Committees are in place in the target provinces and are active.** In Prey Veng there are a total of 25 PC NCCT committee members and in Kampong Cham there are a total of 30 PC NCCT committee members. Members include senior government officials, district officials and commune focal points. The PC NCCTs held a total of 57 monthly meetings (30 in Kampong Cham and 27 in Prey Veng).

CARE’s NGO project partner is Cambodia Women for Peace and Development (CWPD). CWPD had prior experience in prevention of unsafe migration and CARE worked with CWPD to

“I really appreciate CARE and CWPD for this project because dissemination information about safe migration has been done to wake people up so that they understand more about migration. If they want to migrate, they now know where to seek information and have more careful consideration”

Provincial Department of Women’s Affairs

---

5 During the life of the project Kampong Cham divided into two provinces the new province being name Tbong Knum
build their capacity throughout the implementation of this project. In order to ensure quality implementation of projects, CARE provided increased technical support and staffing as needed.

At the subnational level the CWPD staff developed a strong partnership with the Provincial, District, and Commune authorities. The Provincial Department of Women’s Affairs which provided office space for the project staff. The Commune Committee for Women and Children Focal Points, served as volunteer Focal Points.

Communities for project implementation were selected after the baseline survey and in cooperation with local authorities to identify high risk communities. KIIIs with committee members, teachers, students, local authorities’ and community members all report that the project’s awareness raising activities have increased access to and understanding of information about legal migration in the target communities. See Results 2 below for further description.

3.2.3 Result 1: Capacity Building

Civil society and local authorities in selected provinces, districts and communes have increased capacity to deliver safe migration messages to communities, and to respond to cases of trafficking.

3.2.3.1 Result 1: Indicators

- At least 75% of trained government and civil society actors demonstrate adequate knowledge of un/safe migration and trafficking
- Government and civil society actors have improved responses including service delivery and referral on un/safe migration and trafficking
- Government and civil society actors have improved consultation and collaboration on un/safe migration and trafficking

3.2.3.2 Result 1 Progress

In the SMART Baseline Survey the majority of duty bearers did not demonstrate a high degree of competency in interpreting, implementing and enforcing the anti-trafficking law. Few respondents were familiar with, and were able to advise potential migrants on correct procedure for legal migration; for example, the necessary paperwork required. Additionally, there was a lack of systemized procedure for responding to reports of exploitation and trafficking. If a system did exist it was not being adhered to, or communicated clearly to the subnational level. Little data, follow-up services or a system for monitoring of returned migrants existed. Less than half of the key informants were aware of the Provincial Committee, and few respondents’ demonstrated awareness that migrants who migrate legally are better protected by law.6

At the end of the project through KIIIs and FGDs government and civil society actors demonstrated adequate knowledge of un/safe migration and trafficking. District and commune authorities, school teachers and administrators and organizational staff all clearly demonstrated increased knowledge and capacity to understand and deliver key messages to community members on safe migration. In

6 CARE (2013) SMART Baseline Survey
KiIs and FGDs participants would easily provide the key safe migration message content (See Figure 1).

All participants could easily share the content of the key messages below:

- Don’t trust a broker who promises to give you a job
- Seek advice from your local authority about the agent and the job offered
- Don’t sign any paperwork if you can’t read and understand the content
- Discuss and agree on wages before you go and get a copy of the contract
- Obtain a validated passport if going overseas
- If in trouble then call 1288 (Domestic) or 023 99 79 19 (International) –hotline numbers under the Anti-Human Trafficking and Juvenile Protection Department, MoI

School teachers and directors, local authorities including Commune Chiefs, Department of Women’s Affairs and others described participating in training on their roles and responsibilities in relation to migration, key messages, and how to facilitate training. When asked how much their knowledge had increased respondents would reply – “80%, 100%”, or “we know so much more now.” Additionally respondents would report that examples of when they had shared information with community members, family or others migrating. The respondents also reported that the tools used for promoting key messages such as posters, easy cards, small business cards, and other tools were especially useful.

The participants described input into the process of developing or clarifying messages in some cases. All said the messages were important and were still relevant to prevent unsafe migration. All FGD and KII participants had adequate knowledge of safe migration messages.

Government and civil society actors’ responses including service delivery and referral on un/safe migration and trafficking have improved significantly. Provincial, District and Commune authorities reported that at the beginning of the project they did not really know how to help people when they experienced problems with migration.

Examples were provided that sometimes people just went away to work and they (authorities and family) did not know how to track them or find out what happened to them when they did not hear from them or they did not come back to Cambodia for extended periods of time. Other examples were that if a person was tricked (made to sign papers, pay
advance fees for a job that did not work out), that there was little recourse in the past.

In KIs authorities reported that now, they often knew when an unregistered recruiter was in town seeking workers and could easily stop it. Additionally, authorities reported cases where they had asked support or intervention from higher authorities – the commune would ask the district, provincial or national level for help to intervene. One criticism from the provincial level is that sometimes the national level by-passed the provincial level with information straight to the district or commune.

Coordination and support from CWPD at monthly Provincial NCCT meetings has increased collaboration between government, NGOs and stakeholders. CWPD supports the committee to develop monthly action plans and mandatory monthly reporting. Examples provided of success of this mechanism were the issue of women being trafficked to China for marriage and illegal recruitment agencies broadcasting false information on provincial radio required strong factual information to be gathered by committee members before actions could be taken. In these cases plans were developed to respond and follow up. Local authorities report that cases are when appropriate also being reported to the provincial police and actions are being taken to address newer issues such as trafficking of women to China for marriage.

While in KIs and FGS government authorities at all levels reported increased knowledge of safe migration, increased ability to intervene and increased collaboration, some did identify gaps remain. The authorities identified that some people still migrate without legal paperwork and do not seek help. Additionally a concern was raised at the provincial level that the national authorities by-passed them going directly to the district or commune level. And finally concern was raised that the capacity had only been raised in the target areas, but not throughout the province.

3.2.4 Result 2: Empowerment
Community members (men and women) in selected provinces, districts and communes are empowered to make informed migration choices and to report cases of trafficking

3.2.4.1 Result 2 Indicators

- At least 75% of target population demonstrate increased knowledge on un/safe migration and trafficking
- At least 75% of target population can identify the safe migration focal point in their commune
- Number of contacts to safe migration focal point in target communities
- Number of cases of unsafe migration and trafficking reported by the target population has increased against baseline
- Quarterly meetings with district governor held

3.2.4.2 Result 2 Progress
In the Baseline Survey for SMART, respondents’ knowledge of human trafficking tended toward sex rather than labor trafficking, and over a third were not able to determine if a promised job will land
them in a trafficked situation. Only about 10% of respondents felt they should check the legal status of the recruitment agency and employer, and only 7.3% thought going to the local authority for verification and about 1/8 would ensure they have all relevant documents before leaving home. Fifteen percent were aware of community meetings to disseminate safe migration information, however only 1 person had attended these meetings.\(^7\)

Very few knew the identities of the focal point persons in their communities from whom they can seek advice about migration. Eleven respondents (3.8 %) knew of NGOs working in the areas of safe migration and trafficking, only 1 respondent had discussed safe migration with an NGO, and only 1 respondent knew of a hotline number to call for advice in migration related matters.\(^8\)

The target population now has increased knowledge of the safe migration and trafficking key messages. Students, teachers, administrators, government authorities at the village, commune and district level all report that the general population in the target area has increased knowledge of the key messages listed above in Figure 1.

The key messages were provided through a variety of mechanisms including community meetings, individual advocacy meetings and school lessons. During the project cycle it was recognized due to the large number of people that had already migrated targeting students was important to ensure messages were given to the students and the students could spread the messages in the community. This was an effective mechanism. Students reported that among their friends and families it was now a common topic to talk about how to migrate safely. Volunteer Focal Points reported that people in the community now know the better way to migrate. They raised some concerns that not all people still migrate legally, but also said it had increased significantly.

Participants in KIs and FGDs really liked the tools for providing messages. Posters were particularly effective as they were always around for people to see (See Figure 2).

The posters have the six key messages both with a visual (literacy rate is low in parts of Cambodia) and a written description. The posters were hanged/observed in the schools, commune buildings, and other key locations in the communities.

\(^7\) CARE (2013) SMART Baseline Survey
\(^8\) CARE (2013) SMART Baseline Survey
Another key mechanism for use in community or individual meetings was the “Easy Cards” (See Figure 3). This is a series of cards that show what a passport and visa look like and other required paperwork. Focal points, teachers and others using these cards reported they were very effective because they clearly demonstrated what the migrating workers needed to have to be legal. Because they were visual, there was no need to be able to read.

Regularly respondents in KIIs or FGDs would point to the posters and describe their contents. A particular strength identified was the drawings demonstrating the key message along with the description. Additionally, the local and international emergency contact numbers are on the posters. When asked if anyone knew of anyone that had used the emergency numbers only one example was provided. The number was called from a resident in Thailand and the caller reported having to call multiple times before they got an answer, however, eventually the line was answered and assistance provided.

A pocket card was also provided with key messages (See Figure 4). The pocket cards are small cards that migrant workers can take with them to have available information or that community educators can use to promote migration messages. Again the small cards have the emergency numbers for ease of access if needed.

Another resource is a key chain that was distributed with the international emergency numbers (See Figure 4). The key chain can be easily taken when migrating and then the emergency number is available at all times with the migrating worker.

In FGDs and KIIs all participants had clear knowledge of the key messages they had been provided through the various mechanisms. Students reported that commonly in the communities that the community members would talk about the importance of safe migration. Local authorities reported the same experiences. Local authorities said “people know more, they know what to do and where to go for help”.

Through the activities of the SMART project the communities’ awareness of the focal point on safe migration was increased, advice seeking on safe migration was increased and reporting of problems

“Since we disseminate messages to the community people are no longer tricked. They understand more about this and now inform the village chief when they migrate”

CCWC Focal Points
from unsafe migration was increased.

In KII and FGDs teachers, administrators, commune authorities and others reported that more people in the community were aware of the focal point on safe migration and the support and information this person could provide. Children in schools could name the person in their commune and had met the focal point in awareness raising or other activities. Focal points themselves reported an increase in awareness of their role due to the various awareness raising mechanisms. The focal points said more people come to them now and ask questions about migration.

In all cases the KII and FGD participants reported that increased numbers of persons migrating would seek information before migrating. While not all sought information, the significant majority is now seeking information.

It is important to note that during the life of the project, the instability in the Thai government resulted in thousands of migrant workers returning from Thailand in a very short timeframe due to fears of being arrested for working illegally. Local and provincial authorities all reported that many of these workers that had originally been working without proper documentation, obtained documentation before they returned. This was seen as a significant success, both due to the fact that the authorities actually knew how to advise the workers and the workers obtained the appropriate legal papers. Again, not all did obtain proper paperwork, but significantly more workers are reported to be legal now.

Significant learning had occurred in the communities about illegal or unlicensed brokers. Local authorities gave examples of how community members would not report a broker in the community if the broker had not been announced by local authorities, or they would report knowing “what to ask” based on the key messages. Again, the authorities were not able to report that all illegal recruiting of workers was stopped, but they believe that the use of unlicensed brokers was significantly reduced and that action had been taken.

In KII safe migration focal points were also able to report examples of seeking help. One key example was a worker that had paid money to a broker for assistance with a passport and the passport was not delivered or the money returned. The authorities helped to track the broker and pressed for the money to be returned. In other cases when help was not clearly available at the local level, the case was referred to the Migration Resource Centre, legal services or to provincial authorities for help. Clearly, more people know what is legal in migration, what they are entitled to and required to do and are more confident to seek redress if problems arise. Again, while all KII and FGD participants reported increased reporting and help seeking, concerns were raised for people that still used illegal brokers for getting jobs quickly.

When asked about the current issues with migration, KII and FGD participants reported that concerns for safe migration were still there, as always people will be migrating, and that many
districts had not received the messages. Participants urged for the program to be continued and expanded to uncovered areas.

3.2.5 Result 3: Advocacy
Increased awareness and adequate responses on migration and trafficking issues through policy dialogue and public campaigns.

3.2.5.1 Result 3 Indicators

Indicators:

- At least 75% of the target population can identify (actively/passively) safe migration messages from mass media
- Number of policy dialogue meetings held and number of participants
- Media coverage of policy dialogues

3.2.5.2 Result 3 Progress
In the SMART baseline survey 75% have received Safe Migration information. Safe Migration messaging came through radio (41%), followed by relatives (36.8%), friends (24.5%), television (23.6%) and neighbours (21.7%). Clearly while many were receiving messaging, results in the showed knowledge and actions were low.

In an effort to increase the success of messaging through these mechanisms CARE promoted safe migration messages through provincial and national radio and television stations. Participants in FGDs reported that key messaging in these areas was related to different topics based on ‘hot issues’.

In years 2 and 3 coverage was increased to an additional 2 radio stations at the Provincial level in the target provinces. KIIs and FGD participants reported that many calls coming in were related to migrant workers being deceived by brokers and asking for ways to respond or get help.

In KIIs and FGDs with students and volunteer focal points were asked about the messaging on radio and television. The majority had heard the messaging on both radio and television and voiced a sense of pride that they ‘already knew the messages’. The youth reported the messaging on national and provincial radio and television helped to give significant credibility to the messaging they were trying to provide in the community to family and friends.

---

9 CARE (2013) SMART Baseline Survey
Anti-human trafficking day events were held in each province and included activities such as round table discussions on safe migration. Originally an SMS (text message) campaign was planned but this was changed due to the inability to do in the local language.

3.2.6 Result 4: Monitoring, Learning and Evaluation

Project lessons, results and impacts are effectively captured and inform future planning

3.2.6.1 Result 4 Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• A baseline assessment and final evaluation have been carried out</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Qualitative and quantitative measures capture project results from Year 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Project lessons are documented and integrated into annual planning from Year 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Partners report satisfaction and value addition from partnership with CARE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Lessons learned and recommendations are documented in project evaluation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.2.6.2 Result 4 Progress

A SMART Baseline Survey was conducted that documented the situation of migrants in the target area. Based on this Baseline Survey, other relevant data and input from government and experts a key target area was identified with basic messaging. Each quarter and annually program reports were completed and lessons learned were incorporated into the program development and design.

In KIIs with programme staff examples were provided of incorporating learnings back into program design that included adding students to the target group due to the learning that this group is an important group to target because so many people had migrated. Another lesson incorporated was the editing of messages to be clearer and less technical.

In KIIs with partner staff a high level of satisfaction was reported with the relationship with CARE. Both government and civil society partners at the national and subnational level reported CARE was collaborative and helped to build their capacity. All expressed a strong desire to expand the project to other areas.

3.3 Efficiency

A detailed review of the budget implementation was not conducted, only a review of program reports. Based on this review, overall the project was implemented within the budget parameters set by the donor. Some challenges were identified due to late release of the budget and would result in an overall challenge for timing including project start, however all activities were completed. The staffing model adopted by CARE was efficient as well as flexible as it provided adequate support to CWP to promote effective implementation of project activities when capacity gaps were identified or additional support was required.

Efficiency measures how economically resources or inputs (such as funds, expertise and time) are converted to results. An initiative is efficient when it uses resources appropriately and economically to produce the desired outputs. Efficiency is important in ensuring that resources have been used appropriately and in highlighting more effective uses of resources.
3.4 Sustainability

The project has built the capacity of its partners to develop and deliver safe migration messages to the target communities. Strong relationships were established with the PC NCCT, key line ministries, and local authorities at the district, commune and village level. Focal point volunteers and other key partners reported that while they wanted the project to continue and expand, they now had the knowledge to keep spreading the message. The project is considered to be sustainable because it partnered with the government structure to provide resources to implement messages in line with the current situation and government priorities and policies.

3.5 Impact

At the end of three years SMART has been determined to have contributed successfully to:

1. Building the capacity of civil society and local authorities to increase their capacity to deliver safe migration messages to communities and to respond to cases of trafficking;
2. Empowering community members (men and women) to make informed migration choices and to report cases of trafficking and;
3. Increased awareness on migration and trafficking issues through advocacy platforms such as television and radio programs.

The local authorities and community members report an increased awareness of safe migration issues including knowledge of legal documents required for migration, an understanding key areas for caution such as understanding contracts, copying documents and questioning brokers. Additionally all KIs and FGDs reported a decrease in people being ‘cheated or tricked’ out of money or into signing contracts they did not understand. Through the six key messages being simple and straightforward their content has been spread widely. This was supported by national and provincial media messages targeting key issues in migration. According to the KIs and FGDS, this comprehensive approach has resulted in a significant reduction in migration without legal documentation. People in the target area are reported to know what to do, where to go for help and clearly safe migration has increased and trafficking has decreased.

4 Conclusions and Recommendations

4.1 Conclusions and Lessons Learned

The SMART project was assessed to be highly relevant to the Royal Government of Cambodia’s priorities and strategies to increase safe migration and reduce trafficking. Working in cooperation with the NCCT was a key mechanism to ensure alliance with government policies. A significant strength was the project supported implementation of national policy at the subnational level. This included strengthening the PC NCCT and mechanisms at the District, Commune and Community levels. As a result of the project the PC NCCT is more active and the capacity of key duty bearers on safe migration prevention and response actions has increased.

11 Sustainability measures the extent to which benefits of initiatives continue after external development assistance has come to an end. Assessing sustainability involves evaluating the extent to which relevant social, economic, political, institutional and other conditions are present and, based on that assessment, making projections about the national capacity to maintain, manage and ensure the development results in the future

12 Impact measures changes in human development and people’s well-being that are brought about by development initiatives, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended
As a result of the SMART project the overall capacity of the PC NCCT, local authorities and civil society has an increased understanding of safe migration and trafficking and how to carry out their duties in relation to preventing unsafe migration and trafficking and responding to problems faced by migrant workers. While this is considered to be successful, CARE and CWPD staff noted the importance of continuing to build capacity to increase sustainability.

Members in the community have increased knowledge of migration and trafficking. Commonly community members know the legal documents required, and questions to ask of brokers or recruiters. Additionally, an increase in help seeking or information seeking from the focal point on migration has increased. While clearly knowledge and capacity have increased, the system is fragile and without resources there are some concerns that negative practices will increase.

The SMART key messages were on target and continue to be relevant. However it is important to continually assess and update the key messages based on the current situation of migration. The messages must be spread widely throughout as many mechanisms as possible. Expanding the messages to children in schools was important to widen dissemination and prevention.

Generally, the discussion in the community about migration has increased. Community members have received messages at the local level and these have been reinforced by messages at the provincial (and national level) resulting in an increased understanding how to protect themselves and others from trafficking and how to migrate safely.

Project implementation was successful however, not without challenges. Partner capacity and staff turnover resulted in delays in some activities. However, CARE Cambodia was able to implement the SMART project successfully by being flexible in program structure and design. CARE recognized capacity gaps in local partners, knowledge gaps in the community and structured or restructured the project as needed. This included increasing technical support to the implementing partner. This resulted in CARE being able to achieve its overall objectives.

While the project was considered highly effective in the provinces and districts where it was implemented, authorities and community members are concerned that the messages need to continue to be spread and without the resources from the project it cannot be expanded. At the same time this project is ending, the Migration Resource Centre is also ending and the community is concerned for continuation of safe migration messages. However, the current target areas report they will continue with the resources they currently have to spread the safe migration messages.

4.2 Recommendations
Overall project implementation, and achievement of objectives was considered successful. However, in the future, a clear capacity assessment for implementing partners with strategies to address capacity gaps early is recommended to prevent delays in implementation.

While the cost and processing time of legal documents for migration have been reduced these costs should continue to be reduced and procedures expedited to be most effective at preventing unsafe migration and trafficking. An increase in ‘One Stop Services’ for legal processing should be established to promote easy legal migration.
Collaboration has increased at all levels, but efforts should continue to be promoted to support implementation of national policies at the subnational level and to provide information back to the national level on the current challenges faced in the community on migration. This collaboration should include the government and civil society organizations and not by-bass the provincial level.

Resource centres are key mechanisms to promote safe migration and should be continued and expanded. High illiteracy including legal illiteracy means that migrants can be exploited easily and messages should be written in simple clear formats such as the Easy Cards or posters used in SMART. These mechanisms should be distributed more widely.

While migration is clearly a part of the economic system in Cambodia, in the larger framework, building capacity of workers including literacy and vocational skills will increase their ability to protect themselves from unsafe migration and increase their ability to get a better paying job when they do migrate. Additionally responding to the issues resulting from migration including grandparents caring for children fulltime and having less support themselves is important.

Community awareness on safe migration should continue to be widely disseminated. Clearly when a community was targeted with safe migration messaging, the local authorities reported a decrease in rates of illegal migration or trafficking. This awareness raising should be promoted through all possible mechanisms including community awareness and through national mechanisms.

And while international migration is clearly significant and will continue it is important to note that migration internally in Cambodia brings its own risks and challenges and should be considered in any planning for safe migration prevention and response programs.
## Reporting of Expected Results

**ER1: Capacity building:**

### Civil society and local authorities in selected provinces, districts and communes have greater capacity, improved consultation, and joint action to deliver safe migration messages to communities, and to respond to cases of trafficking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>At least 75% of 150 trained government and civil society actors demonstrate adequate knowledge of un/safe migration and trafficking</td>
<td>IEC key messages to improve safe migration identified through review of current messages and adaptation to the current situation. Messages were developed, reviewed and updated as appropriate.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Government and civil society actors have improved responses including service delivery and referral on un/safe migration and trafficking | - Don’t trust a broker who promises to give you a job  
- Seek advice from your local authority about the agent and the job offered  
- Don’t sign any paperwork if you can’t read and understand the content  
- Discuss and agree on wages before you go and get a copy of the contract  
- Obtain a validated passport if going overseas  
- If in trouble then call 1288 (Domestic) or 023 99 79 19 (International) – hotline numbers under the Anti-Human Trafficking and Juvenile Protection Department, MoI |
| Government and civil society actors have improved consultation and collaboration on un/safe migration and trafficking | Safe migration key messages, training packages and program were developed based on baseline report findings, conducted by an expatriate consultant hired by CARE. The results from the baseline helped determine the content of safe migration messaging based on the situation of migration and trafficking in target areas. Recommendations included: how information about safe migration should be disseminated; strengthening follow up services for migrants; and building capacity of local government to implement labour and trafficking laws. |

### 1.1 Review and select appropriate IEC messages and materials held by MoI

#### 1.2 Identify geographic priorities and develop specific safe migration messages, training packages and training programs for each target area

#### 1.3 Implement training programs for staff of civil society organizations, and provincial, district and commune officials (1 per province per year)

Trainings were conducted in Prey Veng and Kampong Cham (Tbong Kmom) - Role and Responsibility of PC and migration and trafficking (49 Provincial and Deputy District Governors);  
- Clarifying roles and responsibilities of stakeholder laws and legislation School teachers and directors (16), Local Authorities (21), District and Commune Chiefs (12), DoWA (2); Police (1)  
- Refresher training on Migration and Trafficking Identification of victims of trafficking: Focal Points (15), Commune Chiefs (17), Local authorities (15),
### ER2: Empowerment:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community members (men and women) in 6 selected provinces, districts and communes in Prey Veng and Kampong Cham are empowered to make informed migration choices and to report cases of trafficking</th>
<th>At least 75% of target population of 16,000 demonstrate increased knowledge on un/safe migration and trafficking against criteria set in the baseline</th>
<th>Two day training for 54 volunteers (including CCWC Focal Points) was conducted 4 times. Two day refresher training for volunteers with strong facilitation skills were selected to participate in a refresher training. One training was held in each province and 60% of volunteers were identified as passionate and highly confident in facilitating to the community. Total of 6 Training of Trainers sessions for teachers attended by 192 teachers from 28 schools.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>At least 75% of target population of 16,000 can identify the safe migration focal point in their commune</td>
<td>2.2 Implement awareness-raising events for community members using trained volunteers</td>
<td>Face to Face: 2139 (1616 female) School Awareness-raising: 15,046 (10,966 female) Teacher Bi-monthly meeting: 102 (21 female) CSO Awareness Raising Sessions: 6818 (3829 female) School Video Show: 40 sessions, 1954 reached (1056 female) Community Awareness Raising: 1591 (914 Kampong Cham, 677 Prey Veng) Total reached: 33,500 (24,968 female)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of contacts to safe migration focal points in target communities</td>
<td>2.3 Support monthly coaching meetings for volunteers at district level including quarterly meeting between volunteers</td>
<td>Monthly volunteer meetings were held in each province. Total of 148 meetings with 69 in Kampong Cham and 79 in Prey Veng</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 1.4 Support Provincial Anti-trafficking Committee Meetings and/or opportunities for government and civil society actors to strengthen links to information and referral services | -57 monthly PC/NCCT meetings (30 in Kampong Cham and 27 in Prey Veng) -Committee members in Prey Veng: 25 and Kampong Cham: 30 -Increased coordination and collaboration | Police (4), DoWA 1, NCCT (1) |
Table: Quarterly Meetings with District Governor and District Governor

| Number of cases of unsafe migration and trafficking reported by the target population has increased against baseline |
| The local authorities and focal points report that the target population are more likely to report cases of unsafe migration. |

**ER3: Advocacy:**

| Increased awareness and adequate responses on migration and trafficking issues through policy dialogue and public campaigns | At least 75% of the target population of 50,000 can identify (actively/passively) safe migration messages from mass media |
| 3.1 Disseminate safe migration messages via mass media including radio and television |
| CARE partnered with the Women’s Media Centre (WMC) for live national broadcasting of a total of 26 safe migration radio shows between from May 2013 and February 2015. Guests on the radio shows included: Association for Cambodian Recruitment Agencies (ACRA), MoI, MoLV and The Coordination of Action Research on AIDS and Mobility Cambodia (CARAM), Phnom Srey, Legal Support for Children and Women (LSCW) and Community Legal Education Centre (CLEC). Implementation of this activity provided 250 callers (57 on air including 19F) |

**Provincial radio**

A total of 10 radio shows were rebroadcast in Kampong Cham and Prey Veng (PV=5 and KC=5)

The rebroadcasts were from the WMC program and were played on Phnom Bros Phnom Srey radio (KC) and Prey Veng Mohasal radio (PV).

The project also partnered with National Radio Kampuchea to broadcast safe migration key messages that were played between November 2013 to February 2014 at various times of the day.

**Television**

A 90 minute TV round table discussion was broadcast on national television station TVK on 21 November 2014 in partnership with CARE, the MoI, MoLVT and NGO Chab Dai.

The chair of the NCCT determined the topic for the program “Employment opportunities and jobs for Cambodian people”. Guest speakers on the round table discussion included the MoI, the MoLVT, CWPD and TV Kampuchea
The program was then rebroadcast on TVK channel on the 6th and 7th of December 2014. This program was re-aired in February 2015 at the Provincial level Kampong Cham and Prey Veng provinces.

3.2 Support special events e.g. Anti-Human Trafficking Day

Supported anti-human trafficking day events in 3 years

Number of Policy Dialogue meetings held and number of participants

3.3 Support policy dialogues (meetings between policy makers and officials at all levels and potential/former migrants)

5 2 day policy events attended by 81 policy makers (42 female)

The events focused closely on the situation of illegal recruitment agencies operating in Prey Veng and Kampong Cham provinces. An additional policy dialogue event in Prey Veng was conducted and was an opportunity to discuss the key critical issue of the trafficking of Cambodian women to China for marriage.

Media coverage of policy dialogues

3.4 Disseminate project documentation to policy makers

ER 4: Monitoring, learning and evaluation

Project lessons, results and impacts are effectively captured and inform future planning

A baseline assessment and final evaluation have been carried out

4.1 A baseline assessment and final evaluation

Baseline Survey was completed

Migration Situation Analysis completed

Final Evaluation completed

Qualitative and quantitative measures capture project results from Year 2

4.2 M&E framework

M&E and reporting framework was developed based on indicators from Baseline

Project lessons are documented and integrated into annual Planning from year 2

4.3 Annual reflection workshop with partners

Annual reporting and reflection was completed and documented in programme reports

Partners report satisfaction and value addition from partnership with CARE

4.4 End of project evaluation

Final Evaluation completed

Lessons Learned and recommendations are documented in project evaluation

Final Evaluation completed
## Annex A Key Informants

### Prey Veng

| **Provincial Level** | Chair of NCCT Deputy Provincial Governor (KII)  
Department of Information (KII)  
Provincial Department of Labour and Vocational Training (KII)  
Provincial Department of Women’s Affairs (KII)  
Migration Resource Centre (KII)  
CWPD Staff (KII)  
Deputy Police Commissariat (KII) |
| **District Level** | Kamchay Mear District - Committee for Women and Children Focal Points from 7 different target communes (7 female) (FGD) |
| **Commune Level** | Prey Thom School Teachers and Administrators (8 – 4 female) (FGD)  
Prey Thom Students (10- 6 female) (FGD)  
Police (KII)  
Commune Chief (KII)  
Village Chief (KII) |

### Kampong Cham

| **Provincial Level** | Chair of NCCT Deputy Provincial Governor (KII)  
Department of Information (KII)  
Provincial Department of Labour and Vocational Training (KII)  
Provincial Department of Women’s Affairs (KII)  
Migration Resource Centre (KII)  
CWPD Staff (KII)  
Deputy Police Commissariat (KII) |
| **District Level** | Ponhea Krek District - Commune Committee for Women and Children (KII)  
Focal Points from 7 different target communes (7-6 female) (FGD) |
| **Commune Level** | Don Tey School Students (8- 5 female) (FGD)  
Don Tey School Teachers and Administrators (7- 6 female) (FGD) |
| **CWPD** | Program Manager – CARE Staff (KII)  
Program Manager – CWPD Staff (KII) |
Annex B Interview Topic Guide

SMART – Safe Migration and Reduced Trafficking

Duty Bearers TOPICS

Introduction to SMART: To promote safe migration to reduce the incidence of human trafficking

How have you participated with the SMART Project of CARE?

- What are the roles and responsibilities of the Provincial Committee? What have been its actions?
- How do government and civil society actors work together on unsafe migration/trafficking?
- What are the most important safe migration messages the project has delivered? What were the mechanisms for delivery? Were they effective?
- What about services? Have the service delivery and referral mechanisms to respond to un/safe migration and trafficking improved? How?
- What about knowledge of safe migration of the target population?
- Has reporting of problems increased/decreased?
- Has safe migration increased/decreased?

What have been the changes in the community as a result of the project?

What have been the strengths/successes of the program?

What have been the challenges?

Recommendations for improvements for future efforts? Lessons learned

SMART – Safe Migration and Reduced Trafficking

FGD Target Population TOPICS

Introduction and Informed Consent (purpose of evaluation, what will happen with info, right to refuse questions)

PROGRAM

- How have you participated in the SMART Project? What are the activities you have participated in?
- Is there a safe migration focal point in the community? What is that persons’ role?

SAFE MIGRATION KNOWLEDGE

- What are the key messages/ideas you learned about migration in the past few years? How did you (people) learn about these messages (key chains, cards, radio etc.)?
  - Safety tips, dangers, prevention etc.

HELP SEEKING
Has anyone sought help or advice about migration? From who? What kind of help or advice? Was it helpful? Are people in the community more likely or less likely to seek help now?

STRENGTHS/BENEFITS OF THE PROGRAM
What are the changes you have seen as a result of the SMART program? What is the situation for migration now?

CHALLENGES
Any challenges in the program's implementation? Or effectiveness?

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENTS
If this program was provided again any suggestions for changes?