



# **Systems-level evaluation of the Seizing the Moment project**

**CARE Ethiopia**

**July 2022**

# Table of Contents

<b>List of Acronyms</b> .....	3
<b>Executive Summary</b> .....	4
Introduction .....	5
Evaluation objective .....	6
Evaluation Questions .....	6
<b>Methodology and Evaluation Design</b> .....	6
<b>Research questions, data source and Outcome Harvesting actors</b> .....	7
<b>Results</b> .....	17
<b>Limitations and Challenges</b> .....	24
<b>Conclusions and Lessons Learned</b> .....	24
Lessons Learned.....	25
<b>Recommendations</b> .....	25
Annex: Table on Outcome Descriptions, Significance and Contribution .....	27

## List of Acronyms

CSC	Civil Service Commission
DFID	Department for International Development
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GED	Gender Equity and Diversity
GRB	Gender Responsive Budgeting
GT	Gender Transformative
HR	Human Resource
HRIS	Human Resources Information System
KII	Key Informant Interview
OH	Outcome Harvest
OSM	Office of Strategic Management
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MOF	Ministry of Finance
MOWCY	Ministry of Women, Children and Youth
MOWSA	Ministry of Women and Social Affairs
SAA	Social Analysis and Action
STM	Seizing the Moment

## **Executive Summary**

- To be added once finalized

## Introduction

In 2020, CARE announced a new, ten-year organizational Vision 2030, and in 2021, CARE USA launched a new four-year strategy. Central to this strategy is to increase CARE's systems-level impact. Working at the systems-level goes beyond the individual level, to influence catalytic change through societal, civil society, policy, and private sector levers. CARE conceptualizes systems-level impact as the changes people experience in their lives because of systems and structures that work better with and for them. Systems-level impact is achieved through the following CARE "pathways to scale":

- 1) Supporting and advancing social norms change
- 2) System strengthening and social accountability
- 3) Social movements
- 4) Inclusive market-based approaches
- 5) Advocacy for policy change
- 6) Scaling and adapting proven models

The above approaches or pathways change systems and structures and in turn this improves the lives of individuals and communities. Across its work, CARE focuses on directly impacting the lives of people across six different domains (or 'impact areas') – 1) gender equality, 2) right to health, 3) right to food, water, and nutrition, 4) climate justice, 5) women's economic justice and 6) humanitarian response.

In Year 1 of its new strategic initiative, CARE USA is working to develop a deeper understanding of whether and how CARE's programming influenced or changed systems and structures, based on the pathways above. CARE also seeks to explore the influence of this systems change on people's lives in at least one of CARE's impact areas. This will help to understand how the organization is doing on delivering systems-level change and impact.

To achieve this, CARE is conducting a multi-country evaluation of programs designed to effect systems or structural level change in Ecuador, Ethiopia, Nepal, and Uganda. This initiative is grounded in a participatory approach with the CARE Country Office and will also increase capacity across the CARE confederation to design, fund, and implement strategies for high-quality programs to influence and advance systems change.

To this end, CARE Ethiopia designed and implemented an evaluation of the systems-level change in one selected project: *Seizing the Moment: Working towards Gender Equality in government structures and policies*. Funded by DFID, the project titled *Seizing the Moment (STM): Working towards Gender Equality in government structures and policies with a focus on the Ministry of Women, Children and Youth (MoWCY)* was a pilot project implemented by CARE Ethiopia between the period of July 2019 and June 2020, later extended until October 2020. The project had a two-pronged approach of working with MoWCY in its internal organizational transformation and the external application of its ministerial mandate.

In line with its overall objective, the STM project set out expected outcomes, outputs and milestones. The two main outcomes of the project were: (1) Improved organizational capacity and working culture, especially around gendered norms at MoWCY - ensuring staff in the ministry are more confident in addressing gendered barriers that constrain their effectiveness and, (2) In line with its new remit, MoWCY as a ministry, has better systems and tools with which to support and hold other ministries accountable on gender issues.

## Evaluation objective

The purpose of evaluation is to determine the systems and structural changes achieved by Seizing the Moment. The evaluation aims to systematically measure the effect of this program on systems and structures and potential impact on people's lives. In addition, it sought insights into the sustainability<sup>1</sup> of the effect and impact. The results of the evaluation will inform CARE Ethiopia's organizational framework and strategy for measuring systems-level change and impact, and support the organization's ability to design, fund, and implement strategies for systems-level change and impact.

## Evaluation Questions

The primary questions of this system-level evaluation are:

Process:

- *What activities did the Seizing the Moment implement and how were the systems-level pathways integrated across those activities?*
- *What were the implementation successes and challenges?*
- *What adaptations were made? Why?*

Systems and structural change:

- *What systems changes through the systems strengthening pathway were achieved or not achieved by the pilot project, including unexpected changes?*
- *What systems changes through the social norms pathway were achieved or not achieved by the pilot project, including unexpected changes?*
- *What systems changes through the advocacy for policy change pathway were achieved or not achieved by the pilot project, including unexpected changes?*
- *What systems changes through other pathways were achieved by the pilot project, if applicable? How were those changes achieved?*
- *How did the systems-level changes across these pathways reinforce or support each other?*

Impact:

- *How did those systems-level changes result in changes in gender equality and/or other direct impacts on people's lives?*

Sustainability:

- *How sustainable<sup>2</sup> was the systems-level effect of STM?*

## Methodology and Evaluation Design

The evaluation mainly utilized Outcome Harvesting to identify the system and structural changes and used desk review, KIIs, and secondary data to answer questions around the process, impact, and

---

<sup>1</sup> Sustainability, in this context, is defined as the extent to which the output/practices of the project are utilized today and whether or not MOWCY has taken ownership of the tools/practices brought forth by the project.

<sup>2</sup> Sustainability, in this context, is defined as the extent to which the output/practices of the project are utilized today and whether or not MOWCY has taken ownership of the tools/practices brought forth by the project.

sustainability. Outcome Harvesting (OH) enabled CARE Ethiopia to identify, formulate, verify, and make sense of outcomes. Outcome, in this methodology, is defined as a change in the behavior, relationships, actions, activities, policies, or practices of an individual, group, community, organization, or institution. Through a series of steps, Outcome Harvesting allowed CARE Ethiopia to document how seizing the Moment has contributed to verifiable outcomes, positive or negative, intended or unintended.<sup>3</sup>

The three relevant systems-level impact achieved through CARE’s “pathways to scale” were:

- Advocacy for policy change (Influencing changes in government (or other) policies, programs and budgets)
- Systems strengthening (Transforming institutions, increasing their capacity)
- Supporting and advancing social norms change (Helping address discriminatory and harmful social norms)

### Research questions, data source and Outcome Harvesting actors

Research Questions	Data Source	Pathway to explore	Relevant OH actors
<p>(Systems and structural change)</p> <p>-What systems changes through the advocacy for policy change pathway were achieved or not achieved by the pilot project, including unexpected changes?</p> <p>-What systems changes through the systems strengthening/ social accountability pathway were achieved or not achieved by the pilot project, including unexpected changes?</p> <p>-What systems changes through the social norms pathway were achieved or not achieved by the pilot project, including unexpected changes?</p> <p>-What systems changes through other pathways were achieved by the pilot project, if applicable?</p> <p>-How were those changes achieved?</p>	<p>-Six steps of OH</p> <p>-KII with relevant actors</p> <p>-FGD/workshop with MoWCY staff</p> <p>-Observations</p>	<p>Advocacy for policy change (Influencing changes in government (or other) policies, programs and budgets)</p>	<p>Director of Mobilization Unit, MOWCY</p> <p>-CARE staff</p> <p>-Other NGOs working with MoWCY</p>
		<p>Systems strengthening (Transforming institutions, increasing their capacity)</p>	<p>-Three staff from Mainstreaming Unit, MOWCY</p> <p>-Director of Legal Unit, MOWCY</p> <p>-Consultant who worked on the Levelling Tool</p> <p>-2 staff from Strategic Management Unit</p> <p>-HR Unit Directorate, MOWCY</p> <p>-Director of Mainstreaming Unit, MOWCY</p> <p>-CARE staff</p>

<sup>3</sup> Wilson-Grau, R and Britt, H (2013). Outcome Harvesting. Ford Foundation, November 2013.

-How did the systems-level changes across these pathways reinforce or support each other in achieving those changes?		Social accountability (Holding duty bearers accountable for their obligations)	Director of Mobilization Unit, MOWCY -CARE staff -Advisor to the Minister, MOWCY - WE-GO staff (CARE staff working with the Ministry of Agriculture)
		Social norms (Helping address discriminatory and harmful social norms)	-Various staff from different units, MOWCY -CARE staff
(Impact) 3. How did or will those systems-level changes result in individual impact on gender equality, if any?	-Review of secondary data -KIIs with social actors staff./ Part of workshop with social actors during Step 3		
(Sustainability) 4. How sustainable was the systems-level effect of STM two-years later?	-KII with change agents and social actors/ Part of workshop with social actors during Step 3 -Secondary sources -Observation of activities today		

**Outcome Harvesting Methodology**

Outcome Harvesting requires engaging a variety of actors in a participatory manner such as the change agent<sup>4</sup> (CARE Ethiopia), social actor<sup>5</sup> (Ministry of Women, Children and Youth) and harvest user<sup>6</sup> (CARE USA and CARE Ethiopia):

In preparation for the Outcome Harvest, CARE Ethiopia received capacity strengthening on both CARE’s systems-level change approach and the outcome harvest methodology. As STM was not conceived as a systems-level project, CARE Ethiopia also undertook a short write-up on the project achievements, and how they related to each of the relevant systems-level pathways.

<sup>4</sup>Individual or organization that influences an outcome.  
<sup>5</sup> Individual, group, community, organization, or institution that changes as a result of a change agent intervention.  
<sup>6</sup> Individual(s) who require the findings of an Outcome Harvest to make decisions or take action.

This OH evaluation, reflecting the standard use of this method, then consisted of six iterative steps:

### **1. Design the Outcome Harvest**

This step requires that harvest users and harvesters identify useful questions to guide the harvest. Both users and harvesters should agree on what information is to be collected and included in the outcome description as well as on the changes in the social actors and how the change agent influenced them.

#### **Different Outcome Harvest stakeholder roles related to the Seizing the Moment project:**

- **Harvester** (evaluator): CARE Ethiopia staff
- **Change agents** (who influenced outcomes): CARE Ethiopia project implementing staff, consultants, other NGOs in technical committee
- **Social actors** (who experienced change due to change agents): MoWCY staff, other NGO staff
- **Users** (who will use the results): CARE staff/Country Office

Between May 18, 2022 to May 30, 2022, the harvesters (CARE Ethiopia staff) conducted a semi-structured interviews with the implementers of STM and the the focal persons from MOWCY to agree on the information to be collected, the potential outcome descriptions and MOWCY and CARE Ethiopia's role in this change.

All activities revolved around the overall evaluation question: *What systems and structural changes were achieved or not achieved through the pilot project, including unexpected changes? And how were those changes achieved? And how did these systems-level changes reinforce each other or not?*

### **2. Gather data and draft outcome descriptions**

In step two, the evaluating team reviewed project documents (see below) to gain information about the project processes, the planned results and the potential changes that have occurred in MoWCY and how CARE Ethiopia contributed to these changes. This information was complemented with interviews with project staff and focal persons at MOWCY.

The data points included:

- Reports (Quarterly, Midterm, final, post event reports, etc.)
- Evaluations (terminal evaluation)
- Project outputs documents (context analysis, GRB review, revised levelling tool, national women's policy review, context analysis, HR review etc...)
- Learning documents
- Observation of current status of STM initiated activities at MoWCY
- WE-GO project (CARE Ethiopia project whose design was largely influence by STM)

The evaluating team wrote preliminary outcome descriptions with questions for review and clarification by the STM project team and MOWCY staff. The outcome description needed to describe the change, its significance and CARE's contribution to that change.

### **3. Engage social actors and change agents in formulating outcome descriptions**

In step three, the evaluating team held a workshop on June 14, 2022 to share the draft outcome descriptions with the STM implementing team and MOWCY for review and enrichment.

Twenty-three actors with closest relationship to the project or responsibility for the outcome were invited to an in-person workshop. This included:

- Director of Mobilization Unit, MOWCY
- 5 staff from Mobilization Unit, MOWCY
- 2 CARE staff
- Director of Mainstreaming Unit, MOWCY
- 3 staff from Mainstreaming Unit, MOWCY
- Director of Legal Unit, MOWCY
- Acting Director of the HR Unit Directorate, MOWCY
- 2 staff from HR Unit Directorate,
- Director of the Strategic Management Unit
- 1 staff from the Strategic Management Unit
- 2 staff from Children's Unit
- 2 staff from Youth Unit

Workshop facilitation was led by the evaluation team who orientated the participants to the aim of the evaluation, the identified draft outcomes and held a participatory activity where participants could walk around the room to review the six outcomes and add their comments to the three parts of the outcome description (change, significance, contribution). Using the information gathered, the evaluators updated the draft outcome descriptions and eliminated the outcome descriptions that were not agreed upon.



Following the workshop, the evaluation team conducted a few more interviews with the director of Mobilization Unit, the team leaders of Mainstreaming Unit and the HR director by phone to clarify outcome descriptions and seek additional information needed.

#### **4. Substantiation**

Typically, harvesters should obtain the views of independent individuals knowledgeable about the outcome(s) and how they were achieved. In the case of STM, these were the Minister's advisor, key NGOs that work closely with MoWCY (UN Women, UNICEF, ActionAid) and the WE-GO project CARE staff. The substantiation modality included a questionnaire via email or by phone (when unresponsive to email) where participants could rate their level of agreement with the three parts of the outcome description (change, significance, contribution) and provide additional comments and insights.

## 5. Analyse and interpret

At this stage, harvesters re/organized outcome descriptions to make sense of them, analysed and interpreted the data, and provided evidence-based answers to the useful harvesting questions. The evaluation team further aligned the findings with the relevant 'pathways' to make them verifiable and show credible contribution of the project to the identified outcomes. The final outcomes, including the description, significance and contribution, can be found in the annex.

## 6. Support use of findings

The evaluation team shared the findings with CARE Ethiopia Program Quality and Learning (PQL) team as a learning for systems-level change and impact. Furthermore, the report will be shared internally to the program management team to consider ways they can further engage in systems level work. The final report will also be shared with MOWCY/MOWSA. MOWSA has showed interest in the Outcome Harvesting approach and CARE Ethiopia will be explore an opportunity to provide training on the methodology.

### Part 1: The Process

The Ministry of Women Children and Youth was established in 1992 and its remit and influence has evolved over time. Its power and mandate was a point of debate until the 2018 proclamation No. 1097, Article 28 which made its role more explicit, describing the powers and duties of the Ministry, which range from designing strategies, facilitating, leading, regulating, supporting, and following-up on activities in connection with the three groups of society that it serves (i.e. women, children and youth). The proclamation also extended the powers and duties of the Ministry to hold other line ministries to account for considering the issues of women, children, and youth. Such conducive and strengthened policy environment, coupled with the recently opened platform for advocacy among CSOs and development partners, provided a great opportunity for engagement and collaboration between CARE and the Ministry. CARE felt it could build on its own local and global experiences to support the mission of strengthening the Ministry's gender transformation agenda.

*Seizing the Moment (STM): Working towards Gender Equality in government structures and policies with a focus on the Ministry of Women, Children and Youth (MoWCY)* was a pilot project with a two-pronged approach of working with MoWCY in its internal organizational transformation and the external application of its ministerial mandate. To achieve this, the project worked by capitalising on the dynamic political context in Ethiopia at the time and utilizing CARE Ethiopia's expertise and learning on gender transformative work in Ethiopia. CARE Ethiopia partnered with and supported Ministry of Women Children and Youth (MoWCY) to achieve the goals set in its ministerial mandate by providing learning, resources and strengthening of capacities in gender inclusive governance.

In the institutional transformation aspect, the project reviewed MoWCY's polices, culture, capacity and norms resulting in context analyses and recommendations, norms reflection sessions and trainings, an HR review and the drafting of an HR strategy and the provision of trainings. On strengthening its external exercise of its mandate, the project supported by reviewing MoWCY's tools and policies to strengthen its capability to hold other institutions to account on gender issues. This included a review of the national Gender Responsive Budgeting practices, the National Women's Policy and the Gender Levelling Tool which grades the performance of other line ministries on gender transformative outcome.

*Review of National Ethiopian Women's Policy*

One of the main outputs of the project was the review of the National Policy on Ethiopian Women in order to inform and advocate for a new gender policy. In 1993, the Transitional Government of Ethiopia developed the National Policy on Ethiopian Women (NPEW) to institutionalize women's political, economic, and social rights. As Ethiopia's first national policy on women's equality, the NPEW affirmed the government's commitment to women's rights and provided a foundation for further legal reforms and interventions. While many of the challenges addressed in the NPEW are still relevant in contemporary Ethiopia, the existing policy does not conceptualize the subordination of women as related to socially constructed gender roles and relations, nor does it consider fully the multi-dimensional forms of inequality that shape women's lives. Because it lacks an analysis of power relations, gender roles, and intersecting structures of oppression, the NPEW remains focused on symptoms rather than root causes of inequality. Furthermore, it needed to reflect issues that have emerged over the past three decades, such as climate change, internally displaced persons and refugees, migration and human trafficking, and conflict and violence - all of which have implications for the pursuit of gender equality.



In 2019, the Ministry of Women, Children and Youth (MoWCY), in partnership with CARE and funding from DFID, Gates Foundation and Irish Aid took a critical step for charting future policy and programmatic direction by assessing the achievements of the 1993 NPEW and involving stakeholders in defining the strategic direction and intentions for gender-transformative change. Includovate -Innovate for Inclusion – was the firm contracted by CARE Ethiopia to review the policy and provide recommendations for revision of the policy. The main role of guiding the policy revision was led by MOWCY

but this initiative had gathered the interest of different development partners, and ministries and became a national effort. A national task force and a core group consisting of 14 organizations, including CARE, was established for a closer technical and financial contribution to the consultants' work. The consultants received extensive feedback in every step of the review, one of which was the need for regional visits to include all regions which had a large implication to budget. The initially desk based review of a few months transformed into a nearly two years study with consultation in every region and most zones of Ethiopia. This included an overall review of the NPEW including analyses of the policy, an assessment of how the NPEW fits into national, regional, and international policy contexts, a context analysis of the functioning of the MoWCY and how it coordinates with other line ministries, and a nationwide assessment of stakeholders' perceptions on how women's lives have changed in the last 25 years. The ultimate aim of this activity was to support MOWCY in the adoption of a new transformative National Gender Policy. The recommendations and action plan formulated in the review of The National Policy on Ethiopian Women served as a starting point.

### *The Levelling Tool*

Proclamation No.691/3A/3, Article 46 states that all sectors and minister offices should address the affairs of women in their policies, laws, development programs and projects. One of the powers and duties given to MOWCY is to design, evaluate, and monitor the implementation of policies, laws, development programs, projects and plans for the participation of women and youth in the federal government. In order to strengthen this work, a gender mainstreaming and institutionalization tool (the Leveling Tool) was used for the first time in 2018 for oversight and support activities, as well as for annual monitoring and planning to growth focused sectors. The STM project reviewed the

Leveling Tool and revised the 16 indicators from a gender transformation perspective. The review process supported in understanding the functionality and practicality of the tool to foster learning, reflection, and accountability; and ultimately to adapt and improve it for better outcomes on gender equality. This was complemented by the development of implementation guidelines/directive to support Proclamation No. 1097/2018 which gives mandate to MOWCY in holding other line ministry offices accountable for gender transformative outcomes. By the end of the project, the consultant produced the final report of revised tool, draft directive and Amharic translation of these two documents for MoWCY. The piloting of the reviewed tool in the Ministry of Agriculture was planned by the MoWCY to test the functionality of the revised tool. As a supplementary activity, implementation directive for the new/improved mandate of MoWCY was developed and submitted for MoWCY legal service directorate. The directive depicts clear roles, responsibilities as well as the lines of accountability of key sectors on the one hand and of the mandates of the oversight body on the other hand in implementing gender mainstreaming. The directive provides guidance not only to the Ministry but also those sectors responsible for gender mainstreaming in terms of points of accountability. The endorsement process would need to take place by the Council of Ministers.

### *Gender transformative approach*

One of the major advocacy agenda and transfer of knowledge for the project was the institutionalization of the gender transformative (GT) approach by MOWCY. Gender-transformative approaches aims to move beyond individual self-improvement among women and toward transforming the power dynamics and structures that serve to reinforce gendered inequalities. Gender-transformative approaches seek to address beyond the “symptoms” of gender inequality to address the social norms, attitudes, behaviours, and social systems that underlie them. Addressing ‘root causes’ means more than providing equal access to assets, resources and services, it requires digging deeper to ask what the underlying causes for disparities in access are. The Women’s Sector of MoWCY is in the process of moving from what was in essence a ‘women in development’ approach to an interest in the adoption of a ‘gender transformative’ approach. CARE Ethiopia integrated the GT approach in the review of the National Policy on Ethiopian Women, in the review of the Levelling tool and furthermore provided a training and manual on the GT approach.

#### **Box 1: Outline of the Gender Transformative Approach Training Manual**

- 1. Getting Started: Introductory Session**
  - 1.1. Understanding Participants’ Expectations
  - 1.2. Setting Group Rules and Responsibilities
  - 1.3. Icebreaker: TBD
- 2. Module 1: Gender Concepts and Definitions**
  - 2.1. Refreshing Your Knowledge on Key Gender Concepts
    - Gender vs. Sex
    - Gender Equality vs. Gender Equity
    - Gender Power Dynamics
    - Women in Development (WID)
    - Gender and Development (GAD)
    - Empowerment
    - Integration vs. Mainstreaming
  - 2.2. The Social Construction of Gender: Exploring Social Norms
  - 2.3. Gender Analysis
  - 2.4. Engaging Men to Advance Gender Equality

- 2.5. Practical Needs vs. Strategic Gender Interests
  - Case studies to address practical needs and strategic gender interest (case studies TBD)
- 3. Module 2: Understanding the Gender Continuum**
  - 3.1. Understanding the Gender Integration Continuum
  - 3.2. Gender Responsive vs. Gender Transformative Approach
    - What is Transformative Change?
    - Gender Transformative Interventions (practical examples or case studies TBD)
    - The Socio-Ecological Model
  - 3.3. CARE Gender Marker
- 4. Module 3: Gender in Policymaking and Planning**
  - 4.1. Explore: What is Gender Transformative Policymaking?
  - 4.2. Policy Review from a Gender Perspective
    - Gender Equality as a Policy Priority
    - Gender-Based Policy Analysis
    - Policy Scenarios (case studies TBD)
  - 4.3. Integrating Gender into the Policymaking Process
  - 4.4. A Gender-Transformative Approach to Sectoral Policy and Planning
    - Gender in Public Policy
    - Gender in Public Planning
    - Gender in Budgeting
  - 4.5. Inclusive Governance
    - Gender and Governance
    - Governance through a Gender Lens
    - Principles of Inclusive Governance
    - Linkage within Government for Transformative Change
  - 4.6. Reaching Beyond Government
    - Building Alliances: Private Sector; Religious Sector; Academic Sector; Civil Societies; Social Movements.
- 5. Module 4: Monitoring and Evaluation – Keeping a Gender Transformative Eye on Implementation**
  - 5.1. What Makes our Work Gender Transformative?
  - 5.2. Gender Transformative Targets and Indicators
  - 5.3. Level of Monitoring
  - 5.4. Developing your Gender Transformative Monitoring Checklist
  - 5.5. Gender Impact Assessment Checklist
- 6. Module 5: Practical Session**
  - 6.1. Review of the MOWCY Sectoral Plans and Activities through a Gender Transformative Approach
  - 6.2. Action Planning

*Internal institutional transformation: HR review, context analysis and SAA*

The Ministry of Women, Children and Youth is well positioned to drive an inclusive gender transformative agenda but needs further improvement in its internal culture, capacity and legitimacy. The context analysis, HR review and Social Analysis and Action (SAA, see details below) sessions conducted in the pilot project explored the organizational performance and

capacity of the Ministry of Women, Children and Youth to deliver its mandate. The context analysis revealed inconsistent communication across sectors and within units, unclear budget formulation process, lack of motivation, insufficient and non-transparent capacity building training and opportunities for staff and an overall apprehension on MoWCY's current capacity to implement its mandate, nor to lead a transformative process.

The analysis of HR policies and practices reviewed the organogram, staffing of women in different positions, analysis of job description and grading, recruitment practices, appraisal processes, and specific policies. The review ended with a series of recommendations including adopting an HR strategy, ensuring adequate representation of HR directorate in the senior management team, adopting Human Resources Information System (HRIS) developed by the Civil Service Commission (CSC), comprehensive communication system across the ministry, assessment of staff's core competencies, team development and gender sensitive measures and policies and performance evaluations.



The project also focused on the structural constraints as well as the agency and relational aspects of change by intensively working with government staff members (senior leadership included) to understand the mind-set and traditions that inform their attitudes towards gender equality. This principle is the centre of our Social Analysis and Action (SAA)

approach. SAA is an approach which involves facilitating exploration and challenging of social norms and practices by individuals or communities/groups of people. It provided an effective tool to identify and challenge the culture and assumptions in place in the ministries and start targeted conversations with staff members and power holders. It further opened up conversations about how to strengthen staff's approaches to underlying discriminatory social norms. Many directors and experts agreed that the project came up with innovative and gender transformative approaches like SAA, Gender Equity and Diversity (GED) and male coaching and mentoring support. In the project evaluation conducted at the end of the project, many staff shared that CARE exhibited the commitment to gender equality and integrated gender in all aspects of its activities. According to respondents, the SAA training has sensitized them on social norm and gender issues. The staff reflection sessions have also helped them find their real gendered outlook and increase gender sensitivity in their day-to-day workplace. Furthermore, the concept of social and gender norms and their role in gender equality became more understood and emphasized in the Ministry's work which led to community conversation manuals on norms which include SAA sessions.

*Example of SAA reflection exercise conducted with MOWCY/MOWSA*

The Gender Box is a tool used to identify and challenge commonly held beliefs, attitudes and behaviors about each gender. Male and female groups created a box within which the societal expectation of the gender within the box and the taboos outside of the box.

The female group mentioned things such as to get married soon and to have babies, to be shy, to take care of her kids, to respect her husband, to cook, to limit her ideas, thoughts, aspirations, to dress. Similarly in the workplace, she is not expected to speak loudly, and expected to dress “decently”, to be an assistant, to do what she is told and not to challenge. The things that would make her ‘outside the box’ are to come late at nights, to be bold and loud, to initiate romantic relationships, to be interested in sports, not to be married or give birth or not to be good in cooking.

The male group mentioned things inside the box such as to be the head of the household, to govern the family property and asset, to provide to his family, to generate income, to make critical decisions about family matters and to be masculine or aggressive. In the workplace, he is expected to travel to the field, to be a leader, to be influential or a decision maker and to earn more. The taboos associated with men are to be emotional, to work in the kitchen, to be care giver or be ‘girly’.

After each group presented their gender box, they expanded into the meaning behind these norms and some discussions took place between participants. Below is a summary of the reflection points raised during discussion.

***What kind of influence do these norms and expectations have for working women? How about for women leadership in the workplace?***

When women take positions in work places, especially leadership positions it is out of the expected norms which puts them in frustrations to win every ‘you can’t do it’ they heard before. They will be labelled as bad boss because of the measures they take, though it is what they are actually expected to do from their role. The labelling and tough environment will be more burdensome than their job descriptions.

Though women are allowed to go out and work, they are still expected to do the domestic works, to take care of her kids...etc. and this affects their performance in work places. A woman with this double burden will prefer not to take some work responsibilities (field work) or promotions because it is burdensome with her domestic duties. All this expectations affects women’s confidence to do their job, even though they are qualified for the position they hold. They may ask themselves ‘am I really capable of this? Can I do this?’ They might doubt their potential. This affects their effectiveness negatively. For women’s who try to do better this kind of environments are not friendly. The environment itself is one of the obstacles they have to face.

The implementation of the pilot project Seizing the Moment had many successes and challenges. As CARE Ethiopia’s first encounter working directly in institutional strengthening of a government

office, there were many learnings on building relationships, balancing varying interests and proving value in non-financial resources sharing. The Ministry had a work culture and power dynamic of its own for which the secondment of CARE staff was essential in order to navigate the office and build relationships. Working with a government ministry also meant sharing the same target group with other national and international organizations. As times, during the review of the NPEW or Levelling tool, some organization expressed feeling excluded and the project had to expand its technical working group. This allowed for a diversity of input and transparency but it also caused delays and indecision on urgent topics. Ultimately, the project ensured that MoWCY took the responsibility of all activities and closely monitored to meet its project donor requirements in terms of time and budget. Overall, this project put CARE Ethiopia on the Ministry's map as the one of the key partners for technical advice on gender.

## Results

### Part 2: Systems-change evaluation Questions

#### *Advocacy for Policy Change pathway*

*What systems changes through the advocacy for policy change pathway were achieved or not achieved by the pilot project, including unexpected changes?*

#### **Outcome Description 1**

**Since 2021, the Ministry of Women and Social Affairs is in the process of drafting a National Gender Policy, thirty years after the first National Policy on Ethiopian Women's (NPEW) in 1993. This revised policy will address the gaps on the existing policy to ensure it answers to the issues of women today. CARE Ethiopia's extensive review of the NPEW through the engagement of CSOs, national, regional and woreda level government offices and communities has informed and supported the advocacy effort for the decision to draft a new gender policy.**

**What is the significance:** The National Policy on Ethiopia Women's (NPEW) has been in effect for nearly three decades and the dynamic nature of gender and the ever changing socio-economic environment has made it difficult for the Ministry to effectively respond to the needs of women. The current policy is very outdated and while it was very forward facing for the time period in which it was drafted, it is no longer serving the needs of women today. This called for review of the existing policy in order to advocate for the adoption of the new gender policy. While long overdue, previous attempts to review the policy did not have political and leadership buy-in and ended in the forming of strategy or 'women's development package.'

**Contribution of the project:** CARE Ethiopia initially set out for a desk based review of the policy, however, it became evident that an expansive primary data collection was necessary to fully capture the impact and the gaps of the policy in the lives of women today. This activity attracted the attention of many stakeholders and other partners and the technical committee and taskforce were setup. The expanded data collection required additional funds which were mobilized through extensive advocacy by CARE to attain additional donors. CARE Ethiopia was able to obtain funding (nearly half a million dollars) for data collection from 68 woredas and all the zones and regions of Ethiopia. CARE

Ethiopia was also able to heavily influence the move from a women's policy to gender policy which includes the need to address norms.

Looking at the results today, the policy review recommendations are being applied, the technical committee is inputting its technical expertise, a budget has been secured and a consultant is hired to initiate the drafting of the new policy. MOWSA is pushing for the adoption of a new gender policy and made a public announcement on this initiative at an event in Sheraton Hotel earlier this year. The issue has been presented to the Parliament's Standing Committee and is on the schedule to be presented to the Council of Ministers in 2023. There are a variety of stakeholder engaged. Furthermore, the context analysis is informing the restructuring of the Ministry today.

The outcome had many unexpected changes and outcomes. The process in itself took nearly two years when the initial plans were for a six month consultancy. The scope of the work and budget expanded significantly. While all of this added much more work to this activity, the outcome was greater and more impactful than originally envisioned. One positive unintended outcome is that, in the process of collecting documents for the review, it was discovered that nearly every topic on women and thematic areas have been studied. Different organizations have prepared policy briefs on several topics. Another positive unintended outcome is the drafting of a National Policy for the Prevention and Protection against GBV. The topic of GBV and its coverage in the new gender policy was a thoroughly discussed topic and a recommendation in the policy review which led to the conclusion that this sensitive and highly relevant issues needs its own policy. The National Policy for the Prevention and Protection against GBV is now drafted.

## **Outcome Description 2**

**Since 2020, the Women's Directorate of the Ministry of Women and Social Affairs has started to adopt the gender transformative approach as a shift from the previous approaches of 'women in development' and being clearer about what is meant by these words and more ambitious about its remit. The gender transformative approach aims to address the root causes of gender inequality rather than the symptoms. The Seizing the Moment project advocated for the gender transformative approach in all its activities and provided TOT and a draft manual on the approach.**

**What is the significance:** The ministry acknowledges that they were previously working to address the evident disadvantages that women face without emphasis on the gender and social norms which are one of the main causes for gender inequality. This approach was helping women with their disadvantages has been used for decades but has only addressed the 'symptoms' and women have continued to be constrained and limited in reaching their potential. Gender-transformative approaches aim to move beyond individual self-improvement among women and toward transforming the power dynamics and structures that serve to reinforce gendered inequalities. This gender transformative approach is helping MOWCY to address the root causes and associated gender and social norms that are holding back women which can have a multiplier effect on the interventions they are already undertaking. Now, similar to CARE's Gender Equality Framework, the Ministry aims to address the personal agency of the women, the structure that men and women must navigate and the relationships they have in the community.

**Contribution of the project:** The adoption of the gender transformative approach of the Ministry was an advocacy outcome of the project which included trainings and integration of GT approaches in CARE's technical reviews of key Ministry document such as the National Women's Policy and Levelling tool. There was initial misunderstanding and resistance towards the concept of gender

'transformative' which is often mistakenly associated with gender identity and sexual orientation. Today, the concept is well-understood by the experts within the Women's directorate but requires better understanding by other actors such as policy makers who still have the women focused outlook rather than gender. The staff share that the Ministry's social norms manual and the male engagement manual are influenced by the GT approach.

The Ministry staff affirm that the concept of gender transformative approach has become part of the agenda, it is recognized and included in the 10 year plan of MOWSA. This approach was also part of the national women's policy review recommendation which further enforced its acceptability. The approach is also being used as part of the Levelling tool to evaluate line ministries. While there is still a need for further advocacy and common understanding on the approach, the Ministry feels confident that it has the capacity to push forward the initiative as a mandated institution.

### *Social Norm change and scaling and adapting pathway*

*What systems changes through the social norms pathway were achieved or not achieved by the pilot project, including unexpected changes?*

### **Outcome Descriptions 3**

**Since July 2019, the Ministry of Women and Social Affairs staff are more aware of social and gender norms and taking practical steps to challenge harmful norms after a series of (SAA) discussions by CARE Ethiopia where TOTs were provided and cascaded. As ministry staff who work for the rights and opportunities of women, understanding how gender norms affect their lives and their work improves the outcome of their work as a ministry.**

**What is the significance:** While the Ministry staff work to advance the rights and opportunities of women, they are still products of the society and adhere to gender and social norms without reflecting on how it affects their work and lives. The combination of SAA discussion orientated activities and scenarios allowed the group to recognize and challenge social and gender norms that negatively impact their lives. This reflective process helped equip staff to have greater self-awareness on their own views and unconscious bias as they engage with Ministry under implement various aspects of the project. The ability of the Ministry's staff to undertake regular reflective dialogues on gender issues and the actions they take following such critical dialogues is a key step for having an equitable and transformative work environment. Furthermore, this approach's integration to the Ministry community discussion manuals has tremendous impact on eliminating negative gender and social norms in the community.

**Contribution of the project:** The project utilized CARE's key tool for gender transformation and conducted SAA (Social Analysis and Action) TOT with 50 MOWCY staff. The trained facilitators then cascaded the SAA reflection sessions to their co-workers of around 150 staff. The discussion notes and post reflection interviews show that many staff had a greater understanding of how gender and power affect their lives and committed to taking practical steps to challenge harmful norms. The project also supported the integration of SAA tools into the Ministry's community discussion manuals.

Relatedly, it is reported that the Ministry also adopted a manual on social norms and gender transformative approach, largely due to the new outlook that CARE's brought. In the ministry's manual, the SAA methodology has been added and norms have been highlighted as something the community need to recognize and choose to change. This institutionalization of the SAA approach by

government also crosses into the scaling and adapting pathway. As one staff explained, “We used to get resistance, they would feel their values and cultures are being changed but now we are challenging the root causes and allowing conversations which leads to participants believing in the needed change.” Staff further elaborate that the SAA approach has changed the way they give trainings, “We used to do mostly Power Points and has a teacher to learner approach. Now we learn together and facilitate their conversations. SAA allows the participants to resolve their own problems.” Another staff shared, “I used to allow things to happen in my life but the trainings made me reflect on why I allow this to continue.”

An unintended positive outcome was that previous manuals used to focus on the negative norms but the community now shares their positive norms and the Ministry recognizes them. With this new practice of collecting information on the norms of that community, the positives norms are appreciated and encouraged. There is, however, a concern for a potential negative unintended outcome if the SAA facilitator is not well-vetted. The nature of SAA brings forth sensitive topics that could bring backlash if not kept confidently or facilitated properly. To mitigate this, the manual indicates characteristics of a good facilitator.

#### *Systems strengthening pathway*

*What systems changes through the systems strengthening pathway were achieved or not achieved by the pilot project, including unexpected changes?*

#### **Outcome Description 4**

**The revised MOWSA Levelling tool is actively utilized and used as a key tool to grade other line ministries on their work in gender, allowing MOWSA to exercise its mandate of holding other line ministries accountable on gender transformative outcomes.**

**What is the significance:** The gender levelling tool is a key gender accountability enforcing mechanism. The Ministry had found that absence of accountability mechanisms on gender mainstreaming was the primary bottleneck for the Ministry to discharge its mandate. While it was initially developed by the UN Women, the Ministry wanted to revise some component to simplify the tool and add new, relevant components such as Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB). The project provided the opportunity to review and put this tool into use.

**Contribution of the project:** Originally created in collaboration with UN Women, CARE Ethiopia conducted the revision of the tool which is in use today. The revised version has gender transformative approach and indicators through technical input and advocacy by CARE Ethiopia.

At the end of the pilot project, this tool was not fully delivered and utilized by line ministries to yield the intended outcome. However, in the time since, the Ministry has conducted several consultations to gain additional inputs for the tool and piloted the tool in the Ministry of Agriculture. The tools still requires further consultation and familiarization at the federal and regional level. The tool is an initiative by experts and it is agreed that it can always improve, “We are on the path to full roll-out. Revision is always possible and timely and can be updated.” One approach to address the emerging questions and minimize subjectivity to uniformly implement the tool is to create a guiding document which is currently in process. The Ministry now plans to disseminate the final tool to allow

transparency and objectivity while also making sure line ministries are aware of what they are graded to ahead of time.

One of the challenges that has risen with the restructuring of the Ministry of Women, Children and Youth to the Ministry of Women and Social Affairs is the inclusion of other vulnerable groups such as the disabled. The Levelling tool only grades on gender outcomes which has now brought criticism as the institution serves a variety of groups. Another challenge is the issues of holding ministries accountable after grading them on the tool. Thus, there is a need to go further into the legal adoption and accountability. This would require identifying the best path such sanction on their budget in collaboration with the Ministry of Finance. One unintended effect is some initial friction with other implementers who felt excluded. UN Women, which supported the creation of the tool, was not engaged in the revision. There are sentiments that all the credit associated with the tool went to the current review.

### **Outcome Description 5**

**The human resources functions and information system of the Ministry of Women and Social Affairs has improved to better suit the needs of employees and to collect and store data more efficiently.**

**What is the significance:** One of the key systems strengthening activity through this project is the assessment of the current context, the HR policies, strategies and procedures to assess the extent to which they are gender transformative and conducive to positive organizational culture. The Ministry had observed low staff motivation, mismatch in technical expertise and assumed role and low number of women in technical positions. The specific objectives included the review of the existing staffing structures, policies, procedures and organization culture, and to implement changes to promote a more inclusive, safer and more effective organizational culture. The HR assessment and the subsequent draft strategy and training has made the ministry more aware of its staffing and procedural needs and testing of the HRIS system.

**Contribution of the project:** The HR review, the context analysis<sup>7</sup> and trainings for the human resources unit by CARE Ethiopia informed the development of a draft HR strategy and initiation of the HRIS system. Informed by the HR assessment and the needs of the MOWCY, an HR strategy was drafted by consultants in collaboration with MOWCY's Human Resources Directorate.

#### **Box 2: CARE's Assessment of MOWCY's HR - Findings and Recommendations**

Brief highlight of the findings and recommendations:

Key findings:

- Understaffed and unqualified staff in most directorates despite approved organizational structure and budget
- Insufficient attention given to attracting and retaining potential and capable talent from the labor market
- An absence of contextualized internal Human Resources Management guidelines

<sup>7</sup> The first context analysis analysed MOWCY's current internal operating environment, organizational culture, existing roles, responsibilities and relationships between and amongst different directorates and the institution performance and capacity in relation to its mandate. The second PEA was external facing and provided a broader governance analysis. More specifically, assessed the mandates and mechanisms for coordination and collaboration with its government counterparts and other players/stakeholders.

- Failure to adequately represent HR in the senior management team (SMT)
- No initiative to revise job grading and salary scales
- A lack of awareness of specific guidelines for affirmative action; weak implementation of policies on people with disabilities; lack of system and practice to assess the organizational culture
- An absence of a system/mechanism for staff to express their concerns to leadership
- An absence of basic facilities and infrastructure for staff
- A mismatch between staff qualification, experience and skills with that of their positions and roles assumed

Recommendations:

- Develop an HRM strategy and implement an HR plan to fulfil the ministry's staffing requirements accordingly
- Request for the clarification or adaptation of civil service policies, procedures and guidelines to suit the ministry's operation
- Initiate cost-effective yet impactful staff attraction and retention models
- Include the HR directorate in the senior management team
- Design and institutionalize a comprehensive communication system
- Assess the need for improved basic infrastructures and facilities and avail accordingly
- Align recruitment, promotion and transfer of staff with the needs and requirements of the role

Despite the very sensitive and critical findings, the buy-in from the leadership at the time was encouraging. Much of the recommendations from the HR review were integrated into the draft HR strategy which was endorsed by MOWCY leadership. The Human Resources Information System (HRIS) started to be utilized for some functions such as requesting annual leave or letter of recommendations. However, the restructuring of the Ministry of Women, Children and Youth to the Ministry of Women and Social Affairs has halted these progress. The merging of the two institutions requires absorbing additional staff and re-assessing the HR needs in this new office location and several new leaders and dynamic.

Currently the HR directorate is engaged in routing work of disbursing salary and awaiting the re-organizing of the directorate and staff. The anticipation of the merging since last year had discouraged the Ministry from engaging further in the HR strategy. While the full scale adoption of the new HR strategy was in the plan for this year, it has been put on hold until the restructuring is fully implemented and requires a re-assessment.

## Outcome Description 6

**Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB) is now an indicator in the Levelling tool, a tool used to grade line ministries on their gender outcomes. This also creates the potential to influence the Ministry of Finance's (MOF)'s GRB guideline which would, in turn, lead line ministries into submit gender inclusive budgets for approval by MOF.**

**What is the significance:** The inclusion of Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB) in the Levelling tool and policy ensures that line ministries' budgets plan expenditure allocation in a way that the budget reflects the gender differentiated needs. This will lead to the intentional integration and funding of initiative that will equality benefit men and women.

**Contribution of the project:** In *Seizing the Moment*, the Gender Responsive Budgeting work is integrated into the Leveling Tool revision and the review of the National Women’s Policy. In the Leveling Tool, GRB was added as the 17<sup>th</sup> indicator in the revised tool. In the policy review, the work included a thorough literature review and qualitative interviews from MOWCY and MOFED (Ministry of Finance and Economic Development). It reviewed current trends and identified gaps in the national budgetary allocation, expenditure and mainstreaming process and posed a methodological blueprint draws from best practice case studies to explain how a GRB should be conducted.

There is a GRB implementation manual and the Ministry has facilitated trainings of the GRB manual by MOFED to other line ministries. However, there is a need to simplify the manual and create more awareness on the tool. For the GRB implementation to be effective, MOWSA recognized that it needs to work closely with MOFED and pose sanctions such as holding off budget approvals until GRB is integrated.

### **Part 3: Individual impact due to systems change**

*Have these ‘systems changes’ had an impact at individual level (on gender equality)? In what ways?*

Much of MOWSA’s work is at the federal/institutional level with minimal direct contact with individuals. However, the policies and decisions made at the federal level do impact the lives of individuals. The assumption can be made that the review of the National Women’s Policy and adoption of a new gender policy will impact the lives of millions. One of the more direct ways that MOWSA’s work reaches individuals is the Social Norms and Male Engagement manuals which are cascaded from federal to regional and community levels. The integration of the SAA approach and the transformation of the gender outlook of the individuals working in the ministry has allowed the SAA approach and focus on social norms to be cascaded to the community.

### **Part 4: Sustainability of system level effects**

*How sustainable was the systems-level effect of STM?*

Many of the activities and effects of STM are still evident and progressing nearly two years later. The National Women’s Policy review has finalized and led to the drafting of a new policy which is ongoing. For the Levelling tool, MOWSA has had several consultations since the draft CARE submitted. The revised tool has been piloted once and the Ministry plans to disseminate the final tool in the coming months. These two activities have been particularly successful and were integrated into the project at the launching workshop, indicating that it is most effective to engage in activities that the Ministry considers as priorities. However, another outcome that was brought on fully by CARE’s persistence and grew into a sustainable outcome is the adoption of the SAA methodology into the Ministry’s social norms manuals.

One of the major challenges for sustainability has been the recurring change in government structures and leadership. The Ministry has had three different Ministers since 2019 and restructured for the third time in ten years. The most recent restructuring from the Ministry of Women, Children and Youth to the Ministry of Women and Social Affairs has affected the HR strategy from rolling out. The HR assessment is no longer accurate because the Ministry has added additional staff in the social affairs department. The project has been to lead many of the activities into sustainability by engaging the Ministry’s technical experts in every step of the work. Output by consultants were reviewed in collaboration with MOWCY staff. For activities such as SAA, a TOT and

cascade approach was used and CARE intentionally aimed to prove its technical input were valued as much, if not more, than its financial input. This transfer of knowledge and sharing of resources has been crucial to sustainability.

### **Analysis across systems-level change pathways**

The project succeeded in implementing three to four system level pathways with six major outcomes. The pathways- advocacy to influence policy and programs, promoting social norms change, system strengthening and scaling and adopting proven models - contributed to impact the system and produce desired outcomes. The advocacy to influence policy and program pathways was utilized for the review of the National Women's Policy and drafting of a new gender policy as well as the integration and adoption of the gender transformative approach by MOWSA. The promoting social norms change pathways contributed to the utilized of SAA tools into the government's social norms manual. This also crosses into the scaling and adopting proven models pathway. The system strengthening pathway is expressed in the utilization of the Levelling Tool and the drafting of the HR strategy.

Looking into how these pathways reinforce or support each other, the finding indicate that advocacy to influence policies and programs is a recurring pathways that reinforced the other pathways. For example, the gender transformative approach was integrated into the system strengthening activities such as Levelling tool and human resources review/strategy. The promotion of social norms change was also integrated into various tools such as the Levelling Tool (by adding indicators/questions around norms), the social norms manual and the NPEW review.

## **Limitations and Challenges**

Some of the limitations around this evaluation include the methodology and time frame. The timeframe provided for the outcome harvesting was less than one and a half month. The evaluation team made many efforts to meet the concerned stakeholders, reverting to phone calls and one-to-one office visits when pre-planned meetings were not possible. The methodology of OH also raised expectations that another project is likely coming. While the intention of the workshop was made clear, it still led to participants suggesting on upcoming activities and expectation for the full project, particularly since STM was a pilot. The pilot nature of the project also posed a limitation on measuring impacts. While much of the activities have sustained, the pilot was designed with the intention to have a follow-on project and fully ensure sustainability.

The government restructuring and change in leadership also posed a challenge in ensuring the sustainability of some of the activities. The project ended two years ago and while CARE has maintained its presence, it does not have an official ongoing project which is making it difficult to request staff's time to engage in the evaluation and other activities.

## **Conclusions and Lessons Learned**

Seizing the Moment aimed to address the institutional challenges to make the Ministry of Women, Children and Youth a stronger institution in its internal capacity and external capability to hold line ministries accountable. Although the planned activities were few as a pilot, they were found to be impactful and became owned by the Ministry after the end of the project. Due to its short duration,

the project at the time could only deliver outputs. However, their evaluation nearly two years later, has allowed for the outcomes to surface.

## *Lessons Learned*

The two main activities, the review of the National Policy on Ethiopian Women and the Levelling Tool were proposed by MoWCY in the design or at the launching workshop and became the main activities and path to building relationship. This demonstrates that designing need-based activities is a fertile ground to strengthen partnership on gender equality and enhance the capacity of the sector. Gaining contextual understanding and being flexible to make changes and add on pertinent activities helps build relationships and yield bigger change.

The intangible aspect of building rapport and acceptability as a new comer to the Ministry's list of partners is a key lessons learned that is also informing the subsequent projects with government. Buy-in from and a close working relationship with high level officials and decision makers are critical to success. The motivations and dynamics of staff is very different in government offices and requires understanding and flexibility. This must be done with care to ensure activities are completed while upholding CARE's principles and ethics and whilst also meeting donor expectations. The project built on the strong and deep relationships and partnerships that were developed with the different departments and key personnel at the Ministry during the pilot phase, ensuring that inputs from relevant stakeholders are included early on, regularly and flexibly in what is often a changing context.

Furthermore into the relationship building and being aware on key players, the National Women's Policy review process had created some conflicts early on in which some stakeholder felt left out on such an important and national piece of work. There are lessons learned around the need for a balance between ensuring appropriate transparency and open consultation to share learning, build ownership and reduce duplication, with the need for maintaining efficiency and direction.

The context analysis and HR assessment (one internal and one external) undertaken were important for building an in-depth understanding of the structural and cultural constraints for accountability around gender equality. Though highly sensitive, they demonstrated how critical such understanding is for enabling conversations which might not otherwise have taken place. Thus, such analysis should take place at the onset of any project and continually keep aware of relationships, power dynamics, and functions that would affect the work.

While the pilot ended nearly two years ago, the expected follow-on project funding did not come through. CARE Ethiopia has maintained its presence and relationship by continuing to input into or fund into the key pending activities through other projects. However, CARE's influence and presence is starting to dwindle as there is change in leadership and restructuring of the institution.

## **Recommendations**

While Seizing the Moment project has ended, CARE Ethiopia's relationship with MOWCY/MOWSA has continued by supporting the key activities such as being part of the technical committee for the new policy or piloting the revised Levelling Tool. CARE Ethiopia is still interested in securing funding to continue its work with the Ministry. Based on the key findings and conclusion made, below are a set of recommendations to potentially apply in future engagement with the Ministry:

**Provide platforms to discuss and create clarity on the gender transformative approach.**

The project has earned the buy-in and agreement on the use of the GT approach from the Ministry. However, the Ministry still has challenges in explaining the approach to pertinent stakeholders to fully adopting the approach. The term ‘transformative’ is often mistakenly associated with sexual orientation or the term ‘transgender’. CARE Ethiopia, in collaboration with MOWSA, needs to sensitize and advocate for the full understanding of the terms in order for the approach and term to be used wisely.

**Improve consultation and communication with non-state stakeholders.** The National Women’s Policy review process was a prime example of joint working with other donors and development practitioners. Initially, some stakeholders felt excluded from such an important and national piece of work and the project had to creatively engage all relevant stakeholders while also ensuring the progressive benchmarks were being met. Going forward, CARE should build on the lessons around the need for a balance between ensuring appropriate transparency and open consultation to share learning, build ownership and reduce duplication, with the need for maintaining efficiency and direction.

**Conduct another context analysis and human resources review for the restructured Ministry of Women and Social Affairs.** Due to the restructuring, there is a need for understanding the current state of the Ministry and its priorities. Ministry staff themselves are seeking clarity on the new leadership, arrangement of departments and the merging of staff from the social affairs unit from the previously Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs. The previous context analysis is being used as an input in the restructuring but CARE can provide added value by conducting another context analysis which considers the recent changes.

**Shift from project based approach to program based approach for work with government ministries.** The Ministry is a government institution that will always be present and instrumental for the lives of men and women in Ethiopia. In the very short pilot, CARE was able to influence many tools and approaches. While CARE has maintained its presence and relationship by continuing to input into or fund the key pending activities, there is a need to have constant presence through a program based approach where CARE Ethiopia can have seconded staff and funds available to influence and support the government ministries. This is particularly important due to the recurring restructuring and change in leadership which leads to CARE having to reintroduce itself and build relationships repeatedly

**Apply similar activities to the highly decentralized regional bureaus.** While ministerial level project implementation would seem appropriate for piloting purpose, these activities could further impact individual at the community level if they were cascaded to the regions. The federalism arrangement of the government gives great autonomy of regions where the mandate of the federal ministry sometimes can only advise or share resources to the regional bureaus. CARE Ethiopia should work directly with regions or support the federal ministry to cascade project activities to ensure greater reach.

Annex: Table on Outcome Descriptions, Significance and Contribution

Outcome descriptions	Significance	Contribution
<b>Advocacy for policy change pathway</b>		
<p>1. Since 2021, the Ministry of Women and Social Affairs is in the process of drafting a National Gender Policy, thirty years after the first National Policy on Ethiopian Women’s (NPEW) in 1993. This revised policy will address the gaps on the existing policy to ensure it answers to the issues of women today. CARE Ethiopia’s extensive review of the NPEW through the engagement of CSOs, national, regional and woreda level government offices and communities has informed and supported the advocacy effort for the decision to draft a new gender policy.</p>	<p>The National Policy on Ethiopia Women’s (NPEW) has been in effect for nearly three decades and the dynamic nature of gender and the ever changing socio-economic environment has made it difficult for the Ministry to effectively respond to the needs of women. The current policy is very outdated and while it was very forward facing for the time period in which it was drafted, it is no longer serving the needs of women today. This called for review of the existing policy in order to advocate for the adoption of the new gender policy. While long overdue, previous attempts to review the policy did not have political and leadership buy-in and ended in the forming of strategy or ‘women’s development package.’</p>	<p>CARE Ethiopia initially set out for a desk based review of the policy, however, it became evident that an expansive primary data collection was necessary to fully capture the impact and the gaps of the policy in the lives of women today. This activity attracted the attention of many stakeholders and other partners and the technical committee and taskforce were setup. The expanded data collection required additional funds which were mobilized through extensive advocacy by CARE to attain additional donors. CARE Ethiopia was able to obtain funding (nearly half a million dollars) for data collection from 68 woredas and all the zones and regions of Ethiopia. CARE Ethiopia was also able to heavily influence the move from a women’s policy to gender policy which includes the need to address norms.</p>
<p>2. Since 2020, the Women’s Directorate of the Ministry of Women and Social Affairs has started to adopt the gender transformative approach as a shift from the previous approaches of ‘women in development’ and being clearer about what is meant by these words and more ambitious about its remit. The gender transformative approach aims to address the root causes of gender inequality rather than the symptoms. The Seizing the Moment project advocated for the gender transformative approach in all its activities</p>	<p>The ministry acknowledges that they were previously working to address the evident disadvantages that women face without emphasis on the gender and social norms which are one of the main causes for gender inequality. This approach was helping women with their disadvantages has been used for decades but has only addressed the ‘symptoms’ and women have continued to be constrained and limited in reaching their potential. Gender-transformative approaches aim to move beyond individual self-improvement among women and</p>	<p>The adoption of the gender transformative approach of the Ministry was an advocacy outcome of the project which included trainings and integration of GT approaches in CARE’s technical reviews of key Ministry document such as the National Women’s Policy and Levelling tool. There was initial misunderstanding and resistance towards the concept of gender ‘transformative’ which is often mistakenly associated with gender identity and sexual orientation. Today, the concept is well-understood by the experts within the Women’s directorate but requires</p>

<p>and provided TOT and a draft manual on the approach.</p>	<p>toward transforming the power dynamics and structures that serve to reinforce gendered inequalities. This gender transformative approach is helping MOWCY to address the root causes and associated gender and social norms that are holding back women which can have a multiplier effect on the interventions they are already undertaking. Now, similar to CARE's Gender Equality Framework, the Ministry aims to address the personal agency of the women, the structure that men and women must navigate and the relationships they have in the community.</p>	<p>better understanding by other actors such as policy makers who still have the women focused outlook rather than gender. The staff share that the Ministry's social norms manual and the male engagement manual are influenced by the GT approach.</p>
<p><b>Social norms change pathway</b></p>		
<p>3. Since July 2019, the Ministry of Women and Social Affairs staff are more aware of social and gender norms and taking practical steps to challenge harmful norms after a series of (SAA) discussions by CARE Ethiopia where TOTs were provided and cascaded. As ministry staff who work for the rights and opportunities of women, understanding how gender norms affect their lives and their work improves the outcome of their work as a ministry.</p>	<p>While the Ministry staff work to advance the rights and opportunities of women, they are still products of the society and adhere to gender and social norms without reflecting on how it affect their work and lives. The combination of SAA discussion orientated activities and scenarios allowed the group to recognize and challenge social and gender norms that negatively impact their lives. This reflective process helped equip staff to have greater self-awareness on their own views and unconscious bias as they engage with Ministry under implement various aspects of the project. The ability of the Ministry's staff to undertake regular reflective dialogues on gender issues and the actions they take following such critical dialogues is a key step for having an equitable and transformative work environment. Furthermore, this approach's integration to the Ministry community</p>	<p>The project utilized CARE's key tool for gender transformation and conducted SAA (Social Analysis and Action) TOT with 50 MOWCY staff. The trained facilitators then cascaded the SAA reflection sessions to their co-workers of around 150 staff. The discussion notes and post reflection interviews show that many staff had a greater understanding of how gender and power affect their lives and committed to taking practical steps to challenge harmful norms. The project also supported the integration of SAA tools into the Ministry's community discussion manuals.</p>

	discussion manuals has tremendous impact on eliminating negative gender and social norms in the community.	
<b>Systems strengthening pathway</b>		
4. The revised MOWSA Levelling tool is actively utilized and used as a key tool to grade other line ministries on their work in gender, allowing MOWSA to exercise its mandate of holding other line ministries accountable on gender transformative outcomes.	The gender levelling tool is a key gender accountability enforcing mechanism. The Ministry had found that absence of accountability mechanisms on gender mainstreaming was the primary bottleneck for the Ministry to discharge its mandate. While it was initially developed by the UN Women, the Ministry wanted to revise some component to simplify the tool and add new, relevant components such as Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB). The project provided the opportunity to review and put this tool into use.	Originally created in collaboration with UN Women, CARE Ethiopia conducted the revision of the tool which is in use today. The revised version has gender transformative approach and indicators through technical input and advocacy by CARE Ethiopia.
5. The human resources functions and information system of the Ministry of Women and Social Affairs has improved to better suit the needs of employees and to collect and store data more efficiently.	One of the key systems strengthening activity through this project is the assessment of the current context, the HR policies, strategies and procedures to assess the extent to which they are gender transformative and conducive to positive organizational culture. The Ministry had observed low staff motivation, mismatch in technical expertise and assumed role and low number of women in technical positions. The specific objectives included the review of the existing staffing structures, policies, procedures and organization culture, and to implement	The HR review, the context analysis <sup>8</sup> and trainings for the human resources unit by CARE Ethiopia informed the development of a draft HR strategy and initiation of the HRIS system. Informed by the HR assessment and the needs of the MOWCY, an HR strategy was drafted by consultants in collaboration with MOWCY's Human Resources Directorate.

<sup>8</sup> The first context analysis analysed MOWCY's current internal operating environment, organizational culture, existing roles, responsibilities and relationships between and amongst different directorates and the institution performance and capacity in relation to its mandate. The second PEA was external facing and provided a broader governance analysis. More specifically, assessed the mandates and mechanisms for coordination and collaboration with its government counterparts and other players/stakeholders.

	<p>changes to promote a more inclusive, safer and more effective organizational culture. The HR assessment and the subsequent draft strategy and training has made the ministry more aware of its staffing and procedural needs and testing of the HRIS system.</p>	
<p>6. Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB) is now an indicator in the Levelling tool, a tool used to grade line ministries on their gender outcomes. This also creates the potential to influence the Ministry of Finance’s (MOF)’s GRB guideline which would, in turn, lead line ministries into submit gender inclusive budgets for approval by MOF.</p>	<p>The inclusion of Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB) in the Levelling tool and policy ensures that line ministries’ budgets plan expenditure allocation in a way that the budget reflects the gender differentiated needs. This will lead to the intentional integration and funding of initiative that will equality benefit men and women.</p>	<p>In Seizing the Moment, the Gender Responsive Budgeting work is integrated into the Leveling Tool revision and the review of the National Women’s Policy. In the Leveling Tool, GRB was added as the 17<sup>th</sup> indicator in the revised tool. In the policy review, the work included a thorough literature review and qualitative interviews from MOWCY and MOFED (Ministry of Finance and Economic Development). It reviewed current trends and identified gaps in the national budgetary allocation, expenditure and mainstreaming process and posed a methodological blueprint draws from best practice case studies to explain how a GRB should be conducted.</p>